## A. The AT&T Companies' legal interests may be substantially affected by this proceeding.

Both Carbon/Emery and the Division challenge the AT&T Companies standing to participate in the current docket. The Division relies almost wholly on the precedent of <u>Jenkins v. Swan</u>, 675 P.2d 1145, 1151 (Utah 1983) to assert that taxpayer standing is insufficient. There is some irony here, since <u>Jenkins</u> did actually grant a taxpayer standing to prosecute several claims, noting:

This Court has long held that a taxpayer has standing to prosecute an action against municipalities and other political subdivisions of the state for illegal expenditures.

It is precisely this type of standing that the AT&T Companies claim in the present docket, to ensure that proposed USF payments to Carbon/Emery comport with state law. The AT&T Companies, in fact, have a much stronger claim than being a mere taxpayer. They are also a competitor of Carbon/Emery. They are among a rather limited group of telecommunications companies required by law to contribute to the state USF fund. Carbon/Emery and the Division try to make much of the fact that the assessment is on the end-user as a surcharge, but this ignores the ultimate obligation of the AT&T Companies to assess, collect, and remit this surcharge. Whether the charge is on the AT&T Companies or the end-user, the direct and negative impact on the AT&T Companies from increasing the cost of service is the same. It is also a subsidy to competitors, since at least New Cingular Wireless PSC, LLC operates in the same service area.

This is also consistent with the statutory language. Utah Code Ann. §54-8b-15 requires all wireline and wireless providers to "contribute to the fund," making clear that this is a provider obligation. In addition, penalties for providers failing to meet their

## MAILING CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that on the 20<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2015, I caused to be served a copy of the ERRATA LETTER on the following person by overnight delivery and electronic mail:

Melissa Paschal Utah Public Service Commission Heber M. Wells Building, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor 160 East 300 South Salt Lake City, UT 84111 Email: psc@utah.gov

I also hereby certify that on the 20<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2015, I caused to be served a copy of the ERRATA LETTER on the following persons by electronic mail:

Justin Jetter Assistant Attorney General Division of Public Utilities <u>jjetter@utah.gov</u>

William Duncan Division of Public Utilities wduncan@utah.gov Robert Moore Assistant Attorney General Office of Consumer Services <u>rmoore@utah.gov</u>

Michele Beck Danny Martinez Utah Office of Consumer Services <u>mbeck@utah.gov</u> bvastag@utah.gov

Kira M. Slawson, Esq. Blackburn & Stoll, LC Counsel for Carbon/Emery Telephone kiram@blackburn-stoll.com

> Janice Ono Area Manager – Regulatory