Utility Facility Review Board of Utah  

Docket No. 10-035-39

RE: Rocky Mountain Power’s Petition to Build High Voltage Transmission Lines in Tooele County

April 21, 2010

My name is Andrea Cahoon (B.S. BYU, local Realtor) and I have been a resident of Tooele for the past 12 years. My husband and his family have lived and worked here for several generations. I just completed reading the petition filed by Rocky Mountain Power (RMP) to build their high voltage transmission lines along their preferred route in the south and east benches of the Tooele Valley. I again have been surprised by the incorrect information that Rocky Mountain Power has provided for your consideration and the consideration of all of the previous groups who have deliberated on RMP’s proposition.

Page 3 of the petition states that, “The legislature realized that there may be instances, as in the present case, when a local government acting to protect its own local interests, rules in a manner that the local government believes is in the best interest of its constituents, but which is contrary to the best interests of the public at large.” Tooele County did indeed vote in its best interest as that is their job – to protect the health, safety, and welfare of their citizens. The entire process that Rocky Mountain Power has had to go through to get their transmission lines approved is not set forth to waste time and money, but to make sure that the lines are installed properly and responsibly.

RMP’s petition states that “The Act clarifies that this Board should leave to a local government any decision that does not impact safety, reliability, or efficiency.” The problem with this is that RMP’s proposal itself impacts Tooele County’s safety. The preferred route along the south and east benches through Tooele County threatens a major drinking water source for Tooele City, will contaminate the ground water, runs across a contaminated superfund site, increases fire danger and at the same time decreases the County’s ability to fight fires; as it crosses a body of water that is used often for fire suppression, increases the threat of erosion; decreases the safety of Tooele High students who hike to the “T,” increases health risks to Tooele citizens due to EMF, and increases blight. This is not a complete list of the impacts that Tooele County will see with this route, but only the major safety issues that RMP’s preferred route will have on local residents.

RMP asserts that “Chief among the County’s concerns with respect to the Company’s proposed route is the anticipated views of the transmission line towers.” (Petition page 5, last paragraph) The view shed is only one part of a large list of concerns. When someone wants to draw attention to an item in their home, they place it on a wall. RMP’s preferred route is like hanging a distasteful picture on the “wall” of Tooele. There are several health and safety concerns that will be discussed in this letter that deserve more merit than what RMP feels is the chief concern of Tooele County with the view shed.

RMP claims that “Tooele County has proposed no specific alternative route or conditions and hence, cannot restrict the project.” This claim is completely false. A consensus letter dated September 21, 2009, was sent to Rocky Mountain Power and presented a route that is acceptable to all entities involved, including the Tooele County Commissioners who all three signed the letter. A copy of this letter is included with these minutes as Exhibit A. Case law has shown that the burden of proof of showing mitigation lies with the applicant, not the Planning Commission.

RMP explains on pages seven and eight that “By statute, the Company has an affirmative legal duty to furnish, provide and maintain such service, instrumentalities, equipment and facilities as will promote
the safety, health, comfort and convenience of its patrons, employees, and the public.” RMP’s preferred route is not promoting the safety, health, comfort and convenience of anyone but its shareholders. RMP will use herbicides to keep plant growth under control in the right of ways as required by federal law. These herbicides will contaminate the ground water and a water source (springs) with pesticides that provides 45% of the water for Tooele City. Does this promote the safety and health of anyone? Tooele City’s water supply is looped and so if this water is contaminated, so is the entire water system. The disturbance of a designated super fund site full of lead and other contaminants which will be released throughout construction endangers those employees who are constructing the towers and local residents as the contaminants are carried in the air. The construction of high voltage lines increases the fire danger in the area. Downed lines also increase that danger. The proposed area has many natural hazards including high winds and faults which can lead to downed lines. The crossing of the Settlement Canyon Reservoir that is frequently used for fire suppression will render the water useless as helicopters can’t safely fly in and out to access the water. Service roads that are constructed along with the power poles will increase erosion and thus increase flood danger to the hundreds of homes in the area. High school students and others who undertake the tradition of hiking to the “T” will be endangered, and residents will be exposed to EMF, which is a class 2 carcinogen. Their health and very lives will be endangered.

The petition and depositions provided by RMP discuss the draft EIS which was released on May 15, 2009. This was the first time any residents had a chance to see what was being proposed. It has been found that the draft EIS contains incorrect information. Attempts to correct the bad information for publication in the final EIS have been futile. The final EIS has just been released (April 23, 2010) and I have not completed my review of it at this time, but no Record of Decision exists at this time. The county also wanted a copy of the Plan of Development which is not available at this time. RMP’s application for conditional use actually seems premature as they were asking the county to make decisions based on incomplete and inaccurate information.

Page 15, section III of the RMP’s petition is titled, “Conclusion and Prayer for Relief.” We as citizens are saying a prayer for relief and help to make sure that this monopolistic company not be allowed to have their way and endanger us. An acceptable consensus route was proposed. RMP was told early and often that the south east bench route was NOT acceptable and to find somewhere else. RMP is used to getting its way no matter who is hurt. Please don’t let them further injure us. I am also forwarding all comments that I have sent to various entities concerning this issue that addresses many other concerns with the proposed siting for your information and reference. Thank you for your time and consideration of ALL of the facts pertaining to this issue.

Sincerely,

Andrea Cahoon  
1289 Brandy Lane  
Tooele, UT 84074  
435-882-8381
September 21, 2009

Bureau of Land Management
Attn: Mike Nelson
2370 S. 2300 W.
Salt Lake City, UT 84119

RE: Mona to Oquirrh Transmission Line Project

Mr. Nelson:

Thank you for BLM’s attention to this important project and your willingness to listen to our concerns and proposals. We also appreciate Rocky Mountain Power’s facilitating dialog to resolve our differences. However, these meetings have not yet resulted in agreement with RMP’s proposals. After considerable discussion and research by the Tooele Valley community, we come to the BLM expressing our concerns and common proposals to minimize the impact of this transmission line project. This letter represents the united efforts and consensus of governments and citizens from Tooele and Grantsville Cities as well as Tooele County for the unincorporated areas of Tooele Valley.

Therefore we present our proposals to the BLM along with our reasons and justification to garner your support:

1) We generally concur with RMP’s proposed route between Mona and Terminal. However we propose transmission lines near Grantsville be limited in number and located as far west as possible.

   This proposal avoids residents of Grantsville to the greatest extent.

2) We propose the site of the Limber Substation be relocated to northern Tooele Valley near I-80.

   This reduces the impact to Grantsville to only one 500 kV line between Mona and Limber.

This proposal accommodates a better interconnection to the 500 kV grid serving the western United States. Although not a part of RMP’s currently planned project, it is obvious that the Limber substation will connect to other 500 kV substations (such as the White Pine substation in eastern Nevada, or Midpoint, Cedar Hill or Populus substations in southern Idaho). Without this additional connection, Limber becomes the only 500 kV node for all of northern Utah and would be located on a dead end line. Furthermore, the western U.S. 500 kV grid has very little north-south interconnectivity inland from the west coast making a northern leg from Limber important to the grid itself. Energy corridors already exist that run along I-80 west out of Tooele Valley to accomplish this interconnection. With Limber located near I-80, connection to future 500 kV lines becomes convenient and of minimal impact.

This proposal improves the 345 kV grid serving northern Utah. The Limber to Terminal line is shortened by 12 to 17 miles having been replaced by the more efficient 500 kV line. Shorter lines between 345 kV substations result in lower impact and in higher transmission efficiency and reliability.
This proposal has a positive effect on the 138 kv grid serving Tooele County. U.S. Magnesium and ATI industrial operations at Rowley consume approximately as much power as the Tooele Valley. The existing Terminal to Rowley 138 kv line passes along I-80 through Tooele Valley and past our proposed Limber location. When connected to Limber, this line becomes a much shorter, more dependable and efficient Limber to Rowley run. It also creates a 138 kv connection between Terminal and Limber available to serve Tooele Valley WITHOUT ANY NEW LINE CONSTRUCTION. At minimal cost, service to Tooele Valley can be doubled in reliability and tripled in capacity.

This proposal simplifies power distribution within Tooele Valley. With a more central location, distribution lines from Limber to points within Tooele Valley are shorter and do not accumulate as they would to get around the Army Depot and Grantsville City in route from RMP’s proposed site.

3) We propose the Limber to Ogden transmission line be routed to minimize impact to Tooele Valley’s residents. This proposal concurs with Tooele City Mayor, Tooele City Council and The Citizens Committee of Tooele as well as the Tooele County Commission who are opposed to RMP’s proposed routes through or south or east of Tooele City and have been designated by the same officials and citizens as unacceptable having the greatest amount of negative impact on the greatest amount of citizens. We propose these routes be eliminated for those reasons and because they are no longer practical considering a northern location for the Limber substation.

We have discussed these and other proposals with RMP. We believe RMP has overstated the costs, risks and difficulties associated with them. Existing transmission lines, substations and a 300 ft tall cell tower in northern Tooele and Small Valleys demonstrate soil suitability. Our arguments here before the BLM are just as valid before the Public Service Commission. We call for a fair evaluation of the proposals by the BLM and a fair distribution of cost between RMP shareholders and customers.

We look forward to a formal meeting with the BLM to discuss our united Tooele Valley proposals at the earliest opportunity.

Sincerely,

Tooele County Commissioners

Colleen S. Johnson

Jerry Hurst

J. Bruce Clegg
Patrick Dumlavy,
Tooele City Mayor

Steve Pruden,
Tooele City Council Chairman

Byron Anderson
Grantsville City Mayor

Bra. Pratt
Kaye Pratt

Tooele City Concerned Citizen’s Group

James Vern
Glen Terry

Grantsville City Concerned Citizen’s Group Representatives

cc: Rocky Mountain Power
cc: Utah Public Service Commission
Patrick Dunlayn,
Tooele City Mayor

Steve French,
Tooele City Council Chairman

Byron Anderson
Graniteville City Mayor

Bred Pratt                Kaye Pratt
Tooele City Concerned Citizen's Group

Vera Silco                Glen Terry
Graniteville City Concerned Citizen's Group Representative

cc: Rocky Mountain Power
cc: Utah Public Service Commission
Patrick Dunlevy,
Tecate City Mayor

Steve Pruden,
Tecate City Council Chairman

Byron Anderson
Granisville City Mayor

Brad Pratt
Kaye Pratt
Tecate City Concerned Citizen's Group

James Vera
Glen Tracy
Granisville City Concerned Citizen's Group Representatives

cc: Rocky Mountain Power
cc: Utah Public Service Commission
Docket #09-035-54

Dear Ms. Orchard,

I am a Realtor, resident of Tooele City, and a member of a citizen's committee to oppose the RMP routes that are proposed to run through Tooele Valley. I am especially concerned with those power lines proposed to run through Tooele City limits and on the south east benches. These routes would have the greatest negative impact on the greatest number of people and the environment.

Rocky Mountain Power's proposal includes a "preferred route" that skirts the south end of the Tooele Valley, across Settlement Canyon, the south bench, and then across Middle Canyon and continues along the eastern bench of the Oquirrh Mountains. There is a local citizen group that has formed that is opposing all routes that go through Tooele City. The reason this group was formed is that there are numerous other options in Tooele County for the placement of these power lines that will not threaten the safety, welfare, and property values of citizens in the county as directly as RMP's preferred route. These alternate routes are not being considered as a priority and need to be.

In studying the Environmental Impact Study we found that it was flawed in several areas. It was grossly skewed to make RMP's preferred route look more attractive than some of the other proposed routes. Several subdivisions that existed at the time of the study were left off of the EIS. The EIS also claimed that the City held no specific general plans for the area. This is not the case. Tooele City's general plan shows exactly what is to be built here in the future. More residential homes. The City even adopted a "Sensitive Overlay" area along the bench to prevent growth up the bench like has taken over in Bountiful. Tooele City also has been purchasing land along the bench to preserve open space for citizens to enjoy.

The preferred route goes right over several natural springs that serve as a water source for Tooele City's culinary water system. It crosses next to the most expensive real estate that can be found in Tooele County. Why is it the most expensive real estate? Because it is located in the most beautiful area in the valley. One can look all around the valley to find the most beautiful part of the hillside and it is undoubtedly the southeast corner benches. The proposed power lines would grossly scar the hillsides and impede hiking up to the "T," which has historically been undertaken by the local high school students for decades.

Power lines, especially during construction, increase the risk of fire. Tooele County is served by volunteer fire departments that would have to respond quickly to fires as the fires would almost immediately threaten homes along the preferred southeast bench line. The preferred route bisects a reservoir in Settlement Canyon that is often used for fire suppression throughout the area. The water was most recently used by the Bureau of Land Management (BLM) to fight the "Pole Fire" that was burning at the beginning of August. The BLM used a helicopter to dip into the reservoir and the water was taken to the site of the fire. Running 345kv power lines directly across a water source that is used for fire suppression is completely irresponsible. The lines would impede a helicopter trying to get water out of the reservoir and risk life, limb, and property. If the line ever was downed into the reservoir, it would be lethal to anyone using the reservoir.

Rocky Mountain Power began using water from the Settlement Canyon Reservoir immediately after the BLM ceased its fire suppression operations for the Pole Fire. They asked Settlement Canyon Irrigation officials if they could use the water and were told no by the water master because the shareholders were already on restrictions and there wasn't ample water to supply their need. RMP proceeded to use a helicopter to take the water from the reservoir to drill their holes for soil sampling. The difference was the BLM had permission and
paid for the water. RMP had no permission and stole the water. RMP began taking the water on Thursday, August 20, and some citizens went up the canyon to see what was going on. On Friday, August 21, 2009, they were told to stop immediately by the water master. On Saturday morning, they again began taking more water from the reservoir and were again confronted by the Tooele City Mayor, a Tooele City Councilman, and the Settlement Canyon Irrigation Water Master, and told to stop. This was not just a taking, this was stealing from the Settlement Canyon Irrigation shareholders, and at least one formal complaint has been filed with the Tooele City Police Department. This illustrates the arrogance of RMP and how they have been “working with” the citizen groups and governments in Tooele. I was appalled that they would take the water without permission and surprised at them taking the crime so lightly. It appears that their way of business is to do whatever suits their needs first and then, after being caught, asking for forgiveness. This was also demonstrated by their EIS which ignores pertinent facts about their preferred route so they could get approval.

This area already is crisscrossed by several low voltage power lines. As a Realtor I have seen time and again people not purchase a property because a power line runs by it, or over it, etc. Federal Housing Administration (FHA) and Veteran’s Administration (VA) requirements do not allow for loans to be made on homes that are in close proximity to power lines. This will also adversely affect the local real estate as it hinders the type of financing people can get for properties and will decrease the number of people who can potentially purchase a property.

These are very large high voltage lines that have never been seen in Tooele County. The lines will definitely adversely affect property values wherever they are placed in the area. Decreasing property values of the most expensive real estate in an area is not the brightest of ideas especially when governmental entities are finding themselves with budget deficits at every level. Is RMP going to be held responsible for making up the difference as to what would have been collected had the lines not diminished the Tooele property values?

We, as a citizen’s group and local government leaders, have presented other less expensive routes to RMP and they have been uncooperative with our city and county elected officials determination that their preferred routes would devastate Tooele now and in the future. RMP isn’t respecting our land or our community.

The routes presented to RMP by our committee, our City Mayor, City Council and County Commissioners are less expensive to the public and are far better choices for our valley and would benefit everyone in the future. Electricity is important and we, as citizens in Tooele Valley, are willing to do our part to connect with the West Wide Energy Plan; we do however object to the manner in which RMP is choosing our “best” prime real estate in their selected routes. We would appreciate it if the Public Utility Commission would grant Tooele a public hearing to review all of the information before granting RMP the certificates of public necessity. We would also encourage the Bureau of Land Management to not allow RMP to build the power lines along their preferred route across the south east benches of Tooele, but to opt for the route proposed and agreed to by the citizen groups and elected officials. Thank you for your time and consideration.

Sincerely,

[Signature]
Andrea Cahoon
1289 Brandy Lane, Tooele, UT 84074
435-850-8167

cc: Bureau of Land Management, Mike Nelson
January 19, 2010

Kerry Beutler, County Planner
Tooele County Engineer’s Office
47 S. Main Street Rm. 113
Tooele, UT 84074

Dear Mr. Beutler,

I am a Realtor, resident of Tooele City, and a member of a citizen’s committee to oppose the Rocky Mountain Power (RMP) routes that are proposed to run through Tooele Valley. I am especially concerned with those power lines proposed to run south and east of the Tooele City limits on the south and east benches. These routes would have the greatest negative impact on the greatest number of people and the environment.

The reason a citizen’s committee was formed is that there are numerous other options in Tooele County for the placement of these power lines that will not threaten the safety, welfare, and property values of such a large number of citizens in the county as directly as RMP’s preferred route. The City and County governments, along with the citizen groups have met and given RMP an alternative route that better meets the needs of this county. This consensus letter drafted by these groups has been blatantly disregarded by RMP as they pursue the one route they were told by the governmental entities they could not have aggressively.

In studying the Environmental Impact Study we found that it was flawed in several areas. It was grossly skewed to make RMP’s preferred route look more attractive than some of the other proposed routes. Several subdivisions that existed at the time of the study were left off of the EIS. The number of homes listed near the area is way lower than the number of homes that actually exist in the area. The EIS also claimed that the City held no specific general plans for the area. This is not the case. Tooele City’s general plan shows exactly what is to be built here in the future. More residential homes. The City even adopted a “Sensitive Overlay” area along the bench to prevent growth up the bench like has taken over in Bountiful. Tooele City also has been purchasing land along the bench to preserve open space and the beauty of this area for the citizens to enjoy.

The preferred route goes right over four natural springs that serve as a water source for Tooele City’s culinary water system. RMP uses herbicides four times a year to retard the growth of vegetation beneath the power lines. This will poison the City’s water supply which directly affects the residents. Their proposed route crosses next to the most expensive real estate that can be found in Tooele County. Why is it the most expensive real estate? Because it is located in the most beautiful area in the valley. One can look all around the valley to find the most beautiful part of the hillside and it is undoubtedly the southeast corner bench. The proposed power lines and their access roads would grossly scar the hillside and impede hiking up to the “T,” which has historically been undertaken by the local high school students for decades.

Power lines, especially during construction, increase the risk of fire. Tooele County is served by volunteer fire departments that would have to respond quickly to fires as the fires would almost immediately threaten homes along the preferred southeast bench line. The preferred route bisects the Settlement Canyon reservoir that is often used for fire suppression throughout the area. The water was most recently used by the Bureau of Land Management (BLM) to fight the “Pole Fire” that was burning at the beginning of August 2009. The BLM used a helicopter to dip into the reservoir and the water was taken to the site of the fire. Running 345kv power lines directly across a water source that is used for fire suppression is completely irresponsible. The lines would impede a helicopter trying to get water out of the reservoir and risk life, limb, and property. If the line ever was downed into the reservoir, it would be lethal to anyone using the reservoir.

This area already is crisscrossed by several low voltage power lines. As a Realtor I have seen time and again
people not purchase a property because a power line runs by it, or over it, etc. Federal Housing Administration (FHA) and Veteran's Administration (VA) requirements do not allow for loans to be made on homes that are in close proximity to power lines. This will also adversely affect the local real estate as it hinders the type of financing people can get for properties and will decrease the number of people who can potentially purchase a property.

These are very large high voltage lines that have never been seen in Tooele County. The lines will definitely adversely affect property values wherever they are placed. Decreasing property values of the most expensive real estate in the county is not the brightest of ideas when governmental entities are finding themselves with budget deficits at every level. Is RMP going to be held responsible for making up the difference as to what would have been collected had the lines not diminished the Tooele property values? The County needs to seriously consider mitigating their property tax losses caused by these lines in some form, wherever they are placed.

We, as a citizen’s group and local government leaders, have presented an acceptable route to RMP and they have been uncooperative with our city and county elected officials determination that RMP’s preferred route would devastate Tooele now and in the future. RMP isn't respecting our land or our community.

The routes presented to RMP by our committee, our City Mayor, City Council and County Commissioners are less expensive to the public and are far better choices for our valley and would benefit everyone in the future. Electricity is important and we, as citizens in Tooele Valley, are willing to do our part to connect with the West Wide Energy Plan; we do however object to the manner in which RMP is choosing our "best" prime real estate for their selected route.

I urge the Planning Commission to DENY THE CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT that Rocky Mountain Power has applied for on the basis that much of the information they are basing their decisions on is inaccurate. They have lied throughout this process and they were told by all of the local governmental agencies that the route they have chosen was not acceptable and would not be approved. There are no conditions that can be required that will make this route acceptable. We have given them an acceptable route and RMP should pursue the route from the consensus letter presented by the citizen groups and elected officials.

When RMP applies for an acceptable route to run their high voltage transmission line, the following items should be addressed:

1. Increased Fire Danger; during construction, during windstorms and electric storms (lightening strikes). Due to this I would suggest that they be required to build and staff a new fire station with full time firefighters near the site.

2. Decrease in availability of water for Fire Suppression (depending on the route chosen). If water sources are compromised, RMP should be required to develop new sources of water and deed them over to the appropriate entities.

3. Contamination of Water Sources due to the use of herbicides to kill and control vegetation under lines and on access roads; Again, new water sources should be developed, that RMP is required to pay for, to mitigate the loss of water to the area.

4. Loss of Property Values Resulting in a decrease of Property Tax Revenue; charge RMP annual mitigation fees to replace the lost tax revenue. Require RMP to pay current property owners the lost value of their property upon sale due to the decreased property value.
5. Potential Health Hazards: Arcing, exposure to EMF; Keep these lines away from residential areas, parks, schools, and recreation areas that are heavily used by the citizens.

6. Destruction of vegetation could cause runoff that may flood homes, pollute water supplies, and cause property damage to homes and water systems. Require that no herbicides be used and that vegetation be replaced in a timely manner. The loss of vegetation will also affect the wildlife. I am not sure what conditions can mitigate that.

7. Disturbance of a Superfund site contaminated with lead and arsenic—this would occur along the east bench of Tooele. Requirements to insure that no lead or arsenic is released into the air from their activities in this area.

8. Unsightliness of Power Lines and access roads; require screening of all power lines, power poles, and access roads. This again falls into replacing the lost vegetation quickly to help mitigate the damage done by RMP's project.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

Sincerely,

Andrea Cahoon
1289 Brandy Lane, Tooele, UT 84074
435-850-8167