



State of Utah

Department of Commerce
Division of Public Utilities

FRANCINE GIANI CHRIS PARKER
Executive Director Director, Division of Public Utilities

GARY HERBERT
Governor
SPENCER J. COX
Lieutenant Governor

Action Request Response

To: Utah Public Service Commission
From: Utah Division of Public Utilities
Chris Parker, Director
Artie Powell, Manager
Brenda Salter, Utility Technical Consultant
Date: April 25, 2019
Re: **Division's Review of Dominion Energy's Energy Efficiency Report for Year Ending December 31st, 2018**, Docket No. 19-057-07

Recommendation (Acknowledge)

The Division of Public Utilities (Division) provides these comments to the Public Service Commission (Commission) regarding Dominion Energy Utah's (DEU) Energy Efficiency year-end report. The Division recommends acknowledgement of the filing with the recommendation that a review of the Weatherization Program, specifically the Air Sealing measure, be a topic of conversation in the next DSM Advisory Committee Meeting.

Issue

On March 27, 2019, DEU filed its Energy Efficiency Report for the quarters ended September 30, 2018 and December 31, 2018. On March 27, 2019, the Commission issued an Action Request to the Division requesting a review for compliance of the quarter ended December 31, 2018 report and to make any recommendations by April 26, 2019.

Background

On December 29, 2017, the Commission issued an order in Docket No. 17-057-22 authorizing Dominion Energy, to continue to offer to customers in the GS Rate Class Energy Efficiency Programs for 2018 with a budget of \$24.545 million.

The purpose of this report is to provide 2018 year end actual results compared to the 2018 Energy Efficiency budget, as approved by the Commission in Docket No. 17-057-22.

Report

There are six separate ThermWise Programs designed to help customers improve the efficiency of their natural gas consumption in the 2018 DEU Energy Efficiency budget plan. The 2018 proposed budget of \$24.5 million was a \$0.543 million decrease from the 2017 budget. This projected decrease was mainly attributable to the proposed \$50 decrease in rebate amount for smart thermostats, 95% AFUE, 95% AFUE with ECM, and the 98% AFUE furnaces with ECM.¹

The programs contain multiple prescriptive measures designed to help customers reduce their natural gas consumption. These programs are (1) the ThermWise Appliance Rebates Program; (2) the ThermWise Builder Rebates Program; (3) the ThermWise Business Rebates Program; (4) the ThermWise Home Energy Plan Program; (5) the ThermWise Weatherization Program; and (6) The Low Income Efficiency Program. In addition to these six programs, funds were budgeted for a continuation of the Market Transformation Initiative. These Initiatives are designed to help educate natural gas customers on the benefits of reducing their consumption of natural gas on an ongoing basis.

2018 THERMWISE PROGRAM SUMMARY

Table 1 below compares the 2018 actual rebate expenditures with the 2018 annual budget. Table 1 shows that a total of \$23.4 million, or 95% of the \$24.5 million total annual budget was spent. The table also shows that the expenditures resulted in 872,692 Dth of deemed savings during the

¹ Docket No. 17-057-22, Application for Approval of the 2018 Year Budget for Energy Efficiency Programs and Market Transformation Initiative, filed October 17, 2017

year compared to an estimated budgeted deemed savings of 995,414 Dth, these savings include the deemed savings from the ThermWise Energy Comparison Report. There were 78,852 program participants during the year compared to an estimated 81,228 participants.

All five economic tests are useful in understanding program effectiveness; however, the Utility Cost Test (UCT) is recommended by the Commission as the threshold test in determining program prudence. Through informal requests, the Company provided the benefit cost ratios for the 2018 program year. The UCT for DEU's 2018 Energy Efficiency Program was 1.24.

**DOMINION ENERGY
ENERGY EFFICIENCY REPORT**

December 31, 2018
DOCKET NO. 19-057-07

Table 1

	2018 Estimated Participants	YTD Actual Participants	2018 Budget Costs	YTD Actual Costs	YTD \$ % of Budget	2018 Budget Dth Savings*	YTD Actual Dth Savings*	UCT B/C Ratio
ThermWise Appliance	23,988	21,621	\$ 5,431,650	\$ 4,498,299	82.8%	190,561	174,790	1.80
ThermWise Builder	16,135	23,832	\$ 4,559,088	\$ 6,539,995	143.4%	103,232	129,883	1.20
ThermWise Business	1,910	1,000	\$ 3,564,234	\$ 1,951,901	54.8%	146,581	65,199	1.59
ThermWise Home Energy Plan	2,800	2,162	\$ 685,265	\$ 435,796	63.6%	36,166	34,845	1.99
ThermWise Weatherization	34,670	29,321	\$ 7,555,172	\$ 7,549,884	99.9%	149,862	110,318	1.03
Market Transformation	NA	NA	\$ 1,320,000	\$ 1,374,666	104.1%	NA	NA	N/A
Energy Comparison Report	285,000	285,000	\$ 600,000	\$ 415,686	69.3%	347,700	347,700	1.94
Low Income Efficiency	1,725	916	\$ 829,426	\$ 642,055	77.4%	21,311	9,957	0.87
Total**	81,228	78,852	\$ 24,544,835	\$ 23,408,282	95.4%	995,414	872,692	1.24
DSM Interest				\$ 78,182				
DSM Amortization				\$ (23,887,962)				
DSM Accruals ***				\$ 278,384				
DSM TOTAL				\$ (123,114)				

* Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

** Total participation reflects rebate and energy plan participants. Energy Comparison Report participants are shown only for purpose of calculating cost effect

*** Accrual made during the period are shown only for the purpose of reconciling ending account balance

THERMWISE MARKET TRANSFORMATION PROGRAM

Table 1 shows the ThermWise Market Transformation Program costs were 104% of the expected 2018 levels.

THERMWISE ENERGY COMPARISON REPORT

Table 1 shows the ThermWise Energy Comparison Report spent 69% of the expected 2018 levels. Current distribution of the report is to approximately 285,000 customers; the report is available to customers via opt-in and opt-out programs.

THERMWISE APPLIANCE PROGRAM

Table 2 summarizes the ThermWise Appliance Program. This program rebated 83% of the expected budget. The Smart Thermostat was first in participation with 12,834 participants and second in dollars rebated, this program was at 179% of budget. DEU has noted that the Smart Thermostat measure participation is increasing, and as a result, increased the expected participants from 11,500 in 2018 to 15,000 in 2019.² The High-Efficiency Gas Furnace measures (tier 3 and tier 4) were second in participation, and first in dollars rebated, with tier 3 (92% and 95% efficient) at 42% and 39% of budget and tier 4 (95% and 98% efficient with ECM) at 123% and 102% of budget. The 2018 budget for the Appliance Program assumed a total weighted cost of \$28.50 per saved Dth. Due to the mix of measures chosen in 2018, the actual total weighted cost for those same measures was \$25.74 per saved Dth.

**DOMINION ENERGY
THERMWISE APPLIANCE PROGRAM**

December 31, 2018
DOCKET NO. 19-057-07

Table 2

	2018 Budgeted Participants	YTD Actual Participants	2018 Budget Costs	YTD Actual Costs	YTD \$ % of Budget	Budget Dth Savings*	YTD Dth Savings*
92% Efficient Furnace	66	28	\$ 13,200	\$ 5,600	42%	502	256
95% Efficient Furnace	6,440	2,315	\$ 1,932,000	\$ 747,000	39%	60,544	24,398
95% Efficient Furnace with ECM	3,020	3,590	\$ 1,057,000	\$ 1,305,350	123%	28,389	40,279
98% Efficient Furnace with ECM	705	698	\$ 282,000	\$ 288,600	102%	7,798	8,925
Gas Water Heater - Tier 2	841	912	\$ 84,100	\$ 91,200	108%	1,878	2,086
Condensing Gas Water Heater	70	111	\$ 24,500	\$ 38,850	159%	486	771
Hybrid Gas Water Heater	10	28	\$ 3,500	\$ 9,800	280%	69	191
Boilers Tier 1	41	4	\$ 16,400	\$ 1,600	10%	608	60
Boilers Tier 2	82	73	\$ 49,200	\$ 43,800	89%	1,646	1,472
Solar Assisted Water Heater (domestic)	7	2	\$ 5,250	\$ 1,500	29%	98	28
Solar Assisted Water Heater (pool)	8	6	\$ 6,000	\$ 4,500	75%	441	331
Tankless Gas Water Heater (tier 1)	-	3	\$ -	\$ 900	NB	-	21
Tankless Gas Water Heater (tier 2)	726	621	\$ 254,100	\$ 217,350	86%	5,439	4,647
Direct Vent Gas Fireplace	352	318	\$ 70,400	\$ 63,600	90%	3,036	2,748
Smart Thermostat (appliance)	11,500	12,834	\$ 575,000	\$ 1,027,500	179%	79,120	88,298
Smart Thermostat (existing multifamily)	90	74	\$ 4,500	\$ 5,900	131%	288	237
Boiler Reset Control (appliance)	20	-	\$ 2,000	\$ -	0%	86	-
Combined Space and Hot Water	5	2	\$ 3,750	\$ 1,500	40%	76	30
Combined Space and Hot Water (existing multifamily)	5	1	\$ 3,750	\$ 750	20%	56	11
Correction	-	1	\$ -	\$ 50	NB	-	1
Administrative & Overheads	NA	NA	\$ 1,045,000	\$ 642,949	62%	NA	NA
TOTAL	23,988	21,621	\$ 5,431,650	\$ 4,498,299	83%	190,561	174,790

* Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

² Docket No. 18-057-20, Application for Approval of the 2019 Year Budget for Energy Efficiency Programs and Market Transformation Initiative, filed October 16, 2018.

THERMWISE BUILDER PROGRAM

The ThermWise Builder Program is designed to offer builders who use energy efficient construction techniques specific rebates. The program is available to residential builders in the Company's Utah service territory and include rebates for installing natural gas energy-efficiency measures in newly constructed single and multifamily residences receiving service on the GS rate schedule.

As shown in Table 3, the Builder Program rebated 143% of its budget. The 95% High-Efficiency Gas Furnace measures, single family and multi-family, had the greatest participation as well as dollars rebated, followed by the 2x6 R-23 Walls measure at 685% of budget. The 2018 budget for the Builder Program assumed a total weighted cost of \$44.16 per saved Dth. The actual total weighted cost for the 2018 budgeted measures is \$50.35 per saved Dth.

**DOMINION ENERGY
THERMWISE BUILDER PROGRAM**

December 31, 2018
DOCKET NO. 19-057-07

Table 3

	2018 Estimated Participants	YTD Actual Participants	2018 Budget Costs	YTD Actual Costs	YTD \$ % of Budget	Budget Dth Savings	YTD Dth Savings*
HERS Index 62 or lower	800	1,643	\$ 80,000	\$ 164,300	205%	3,328	6,835
HERS Index 55 or lower	12	1,105	\$ 2,400	\$ 221,000	9208%	100	9,194
HERS Index 48 or lower	8	23	\$ 2,400	\$ 6,900	288%	100	287
Energy Star 3.0 Bonus	150	732	\$ 7,500	\$ 36,600	488%	334	1,628
92% Efficient Furnace	450	231	\$ 90,000	\$ 46,200	51%	2,916	1,686
95% Efficient Furnace	8,500	5,602	\$ 2,550,000	\$ 1,832,500	72%	68,850	47,999
95% Efficient Furnace with ECM	500	1,698	\$ 175,000	\$ 651,600	372%	4,050	14,742
98% Efficient Furnace with ECM	20	9	\$ 8,000	\$ 3,950	49%	194	88
.67 EF Storage Water Heater	515	1,723	\$ 51,500	\$ 172,300	335%	1,178	3,942
Tankless Water Heater	-	128	\$ -	\$ 38,400	NA	-	859
Tankless Water Heater Tier 2	110	423	\$ 38,500	\$ 148,050	385%	942	3,621
Condensing Gas Water Heater	10	1	\$ 3,500	\$ 350	10%	69	7
Hybrid Gas Water Heater	5	1	\$ 1,750	\$ 350	20%	35	7
Gas Boiler Rebates Paid - Tier 1	9	1	\$ 3,600	\$ 400	11%	65	10
Gas Boiler Rebates Paid - Tier 2	33	11	\$ 19,800	\$ 6,600	33%	425	142
Solar Assisted Water Heater - domestic	5	-	\$ 3,750	\$ -	0%	70	-
Solar Assisted Water Heater - pool	5	-	\$ 3,750	\$ -	0%	276	-
2x6 Walls	-	8	\$ -	\$ 2,800	NA	-	82
2X6 R-23 Walls	400	2,738	\$ 60,000	\$ 410,700	685%	1,728	11,828
R-5 Windows	335	128	\$ 838	\$ 4,706	562%	8	42
Smart Thermostat	450	282	\$ 22,500	\$ 26,750	119%	1,548	970
Combined Space and Hot Water	5	-	\$ 3,750	\$ -	0%	73	-
HERS Index 62 or lower - Multifamily	10	1,377	\$ 500	\$ 68,850	13770%	18	2,534
HERS Index 55 or lower - Multifamily	-	646	\$ -	\$ 64,600	NA	-	2,377
Energy Star 3.0 Bonus - Multifamily	-	798	\$ -	\$ 19,950	NA	-	721
92% Efficient Furnace - Multifamily	1,200	399	\$ 240,000	\$ 79,800	33%	5,856	1,838
95% Efficient Furnace - Multifamily	1,500	2,841	\$ 450,000	\$ 954,600	212%	9,120	15,473
95% Efficient Furnace with ECM - Multifamily	33	60	\$ 11,550	\$ 23,950	207%	201	313
98% Efficient Furnace with ECM - Multifamily	5	-	\$ 2,000	\$ -	0%	36	-
.67 EF Storage Water Heater - Multifamily	715	883	\$ 71,500	\$ 88,300	123%	795	982
Tankless Water Heater Tier 2 - Multifamily	5	300	\$ 1,750	\$ 105,000	6000%	27	1,620
Hybrid Gas Water Heater - Multifamily	5	-	\$ 1,750	\$ -	0%	22	-
Boilers Tier 1 - Multifamily	5	-	\$ 2,000	\$ -	0%	36	-
Boilers Tier 2 - Multifamily	5	-	\$ 3,000	\$ -	0%	64	-
Solar Assisted Water Heater - domestic Multifamily	5	-	\$ 3,750	\$ -	0%	70	-
Solar Assisted Water Heater - Pool Multifamily	5	-	\$ 3,750	\$ -	0%	276	-
Smart Thermostat - Multifamily	5	41	\$ 250	\$ 3,650	1460%	7	56
Combined Space and Hot Water - Multifamily	15	-	\$ 11,250	\$ -	0%	144	-
Energy Star Highrise - Multifamily	300	-	\$ 7,500	\$ -	0%	271	-
Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	\$ 620,000	\$ 1,356,839	219%	N/A	N/A
TOTAL	16,135	23,832	\$ 4,559,088	\$ 6,539,995	143%	103,232	129,883

* Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

THERMWISE BUSINESS PROGRAM

In the ThermWise Business Program, there are over 30 prescriptive measures available to commercial entities to improve their energy efficiency. Table 4 provides the detail of those measures. There were 15 measures that had \$10,000 or more of total 2018 rebate incentive costs. The total rebate expense of these 15 measures is \$1.3 million, which accounts for 65% of the rebates paid. For the year, the total program spent 55% of the annual budget. The 2018 budget cost per deemed Dth saved was \$24.32 compared to an actual cost of \$29.94.

**DOMINION ENERGY
THERMWISE BUSINESS PROGRAM**

December 31, 2018
DOCKET NO. 19-057-07

Table 4

	2018 Estimated Participants	YTD Actual Participants	2018 Budget Costs	YTD Actual Costs	YTD \$ % of Budget	Budget Dth Savings	YTD Dth Savings*
Business Custom	20	15	\$ 80,000	\$ 27,704	35%	20,000	3,918
92% Efficient Furnace	2	-	\$ 400	\$ -	0%	16	-
95% Efficient Furnace	250	336	\$ 75,000	\$ 112,000	149%	2,354	4,299
95% Efficient Furnace with ECM	100	96	\$ 35,000	\$ 37,300	107%	942	1,279
98% Efficient Furnace with ECM NEW 2017	15	1	\$ 6,000	\$ 450	8%	166	17
Gas Storage Water Heater - Tier 2 <75kBtu .67	5	1	\$ 500	\$ 100	20%	12	2
Gas Storage Water Heater >75kBtu	10	52	\$ 6,000	\$ 29,561	493%	696	3,429
High Efficiency Gas Water Heater - Tankless <200kBTU	10	2	\$ 4,000	\$ 702	18%	280	50
High Efficiency Gas Water Heater - Tankless >200kBTU	15	23	\$ 15,300	\$ 28,975	189%	1,071	2,044
Condensing Gas Water Heater NEW 2017	3	1	\$ 1,050	\$ 350	33%	24	8
Hybrid Gas Water Heater	5	2	\$ 1,750	\$ 700	40%	41	16
Combined Space / Water Heater (business)	5	-	\$ 2,250	\$ -	0%	75	-
Commercial Clothes Washer	5	-	\$ 375	\$ -	0%	10	-
Boiler Reset Control	10	-	\$ 2,500	\$ -	0%	593	-
Boiler Tune-up Tier 1	10	14	\$ 1,000	\$ 1,400	140%	78	110
Boiler Tune-up Tier 2	5	-	\$ 750	\$ -	0%	195	-
Boiler Tune-up Tier 3	15	9	\$ 3,750	\$ 2,250	60%	864	630
Low Flow Pre-rinse Spray Valve	25	-	\$ 800	\$ -	0%	216	-
Smart Thermostat (business)	150	157	\$ 10,500	\$ 13,996	133%	840	1,120
Direct Contact Water Heater	1	-	\$ 298	\$ -	0%	50	-
High Efficiency Boiler Hot Water Tier 1	30	-	\$ 120,000	\$ -	0%	8,621	-
High Efficiency Boiler Hot Water Tier 2	-	27	\$ -	\$ 65,153	NB	-	5,442
High Efficiency Boiler Hot Water Tier 2	60	8	\$ 243,750	\$ 34,769	14%	12,000	1,712
Boiler Hot Water ≥ 2,500,000 Btu/h (business)	-	-	\$ -	\$ -	-	-	-
Boiler Hot Water ≥ 2,500,000 Btu/h (business)	90	39	\$ 877,500	\$ 446,875	51%	43,200	23,716
High Efficiency Boiler Steam Tier 1	1	-	\$ 4,140	\$ -	0%	297	-
High Efficiency Boiler Steam Tier 2	-	2	\$ -	\$ 16,259	NB	-	2,211
Boiler Steam (Except Natural Draft) ≥ 300,000 Btu/h (business) NEW 2017	2	-	\$ 21,612	\$ -	0%	605	-
Boiler Steam (Natural Draft) ≥ 300,000 Btu/h (business)	1	-	\$ 10,806	\$ -	0%	519	-
Gas Unit Heater NonCondensing	10	2	\$ 2,500	\$ 150	6%	88	5
Gas Unit Heater Condensing	50	-	\$ 81,000	\$ -	0%	1,832	-
Infrared Heating System	700	48	\$ 525,000	\$ 28,415	5%	40,432	2,188
Modulating Infrared Heaters (NC or Replacing Non-IR) (business)	1	12	\$ 1,088	\$ 3,900	358%	64	229
Modulating Infrared Heaters (Replacing Non-IR) (business)	1	-	\$ 290	\$ -	0%	8	-
Condensing RTU's (business)	1	-	\$ 1,875	\$ -	0%	123	-
High Efficiency Gas Combo Oven	10	4	\$ 10,000	\$ 4,000	40%	322	129
Energy Star Gas Commercial Fryer	30	22	\$ 22,500	\$ 11,000	49%	1,454	711
High Efficiency Gas Convection Oven	10	46	\$ 7,500	\$ 23,000	307%	194	594
High Efficiency Gas Griddle	5	-	\$ 1,500	\$ -	0%	35	-
Energy Star Gas Steam Cooker	2	-	\$ 2,000	\$ -	0%	56	-
Attic Insulation (retrofit)	150	13	\$ 168,000	\$ 11,565	7%	3,864	353
Wall Insulation (retrofit)	10	-	\$ 12,000	\$ -	0%	290	-
Demand Control Ventilation Systems	3	54	\$ 20,000	\$ 389,167	1946%	1,088	10,585
Demand Control Ventilation Systems (DCV) Package (no BMS)	50	12	\$ 11,250	\$ 4,800	43%	1,224	261
Pipe Insulation (Hot Water)	10	-	\$ 750	\$ -	0%	337	-
Pipe Insulation (Steam)	5	-	\$ 1,000	\$ -	0%	625	-
High Efficiency Charbroiler	5	-	\$ 5,000	\$ -	0%	300	-
Conveyor Oven	5	2	\$ 5,000	\$ 2,000	40%	354	141
Gas Dryer Moisture Sensor	5	-	\$ 125	\$ -	0%	45	-
Modulating Gas Dryer	1	-	\$ 75	\$ -	0%	26	-
Solar Assisted Water Heater- Pool- Business	1	-	\$ 750	\$ -	0%	55	-
Correction	-	-	\$ -	\$ (398,000)	-	-	-
Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	\$ 1,160,000	\$ 1,053,360	91%	NA	N/A
Total	1,910	1,000	\$ 3,564,234	\$ 1,951,901	55%	146,581	65,199

* Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

THERMWISE HOME ENERGY PLAN PROGRAM

The ThermWise Home Energy Plan Program is designed to give customers an opportunity to have their current energy efficiency efforts evaluated, with suggestions offered on ways to improve those efforts. The home energy plans can either be an on-site audit, conducted by a qualified DEU technician or a mail in audit in which the participants answers questions and receive advice from DEU. This program continues to have benefits in addition to those seen in the data below as it introduces customers to the potential savings they may realize by implementing additional energy efficiency measures. Table 5 shows Dth savings in 2018 was 34,845. This is an increase from 2017 savings of 30,851.

**DOMINION ENERGY
THERMWISE HOME ENERGY PLAN PROGRAM**

December 31, 2018
DOCKET NO. 19-057-07

Table 5

	2018 Estimated Participants	YTD Actual Participants	2018 Budget Costs	YTD Actual Costs	YTD \$ % of Budget	Budget Dth Savings	YTD Dth Savings*
Efficiency Measures	2,800	2,162	\$ 52,265	\$ 41,366	79.1%	36,166	34,845
Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	\$ 633,000	\$ 394,430	62.3%	N/A	N/A
TOTAL	2,800	2,162	\$ 685,265	\$ 435,796	63.6%	36,166	34,845

* Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

THERMWISE WEATHERIZATION PROGRAM

Table 6 summarizes the results for the ThermWise Weatherization Program. Weatherization projects were the highest rebated measures of the DEUs Energy Efficiency Program and increased substantially in 2018 from 2017 levels. On a total program basis, the Weatherization Program reached 99.9% of budgeted expenditures where the 2017 Weatherization Program reached 55.8% of budgeted expenditures. The primary driver of the Weatherization Program was Air Sealing. Air Sealing appears to be a program measure that should be evaluated in subsequent budget filings as actual costs were 3271% of budget with participation at 3308% of budget. The

Company's 2019 budget filing³ increased the Air Sealing budgeted levels of participation from 200 in 2018, to 2,000 in 2019 but it is very likely this may not have been enough.

DOMINION ENERGY
THERMWISE WEATHERIZATION PROGRAM
December 31, 2018
DOCKET NO. 19-057-07
Table 6

	2018 Estimated Participants	YTD Actual Participants	2018 Budget Costs	YTD Actual Costs	YTD \$ % of Budget	Budget Dth Savings	YTD Dth Savings*
Attic Insulation - Tier 1	7,600	7,138	\$ 2,660,000	\$ 1,583,877	59.5%	45,114	26,863
Attic Insulation - Tier 2	1,800	3,049	\$ 176,400	\$ 269,900	153.0%	2,621	4,010
Floor Insulation	400	89	\$ 65,600	\$ 17,100	26.1%	1,784	465
Wall Insulation	500	390	\$ 129,000	\$ 111,978	86.8%	1,823	1,583
Windows - R-5	8,500	9,216	\$ 318,750	\$ 350,880	110.1%	7,120	7,837
Duct Sealing & Insulation	2,000	250	\$ 838,462	\$ 76,499	9.1%	21,568	2,696
Air Sealing	200	6,616	\$ 105,336	\$ 3,445,929	3271.4%	1,839	55,135
Pipe Insulation	800	-	\$ 2,000	\$ -	0.0%	608	-
ICAST pilot	1,000	860	\$ 400,000	\$ 331,848	83.0%	12,500	8,600
Attic Insulation Tier 1 (multifamily)	4,000	176	\$ 989,355	\$ 26,474	2.7%	16,779	449
Attic Insulation Tier 2 (multifamily)	2,200	38	\$ 148,672	\$ 1,522	1.0%	2,209	23
Floor Insulation (multifamily)	20	-	\$ 364	\$ -	0.0%	10	-
Wall Insulation (multifamily)	10	-	\$ 1,020	\$ -	0.0%	14	-
Windows - R-5 (multifamily)	40	1,415	\$ 1,500	\$ 94,887	6325.8%	34	2,119
Duct Sealing & Insulation (multifamily)	5,600	84	\$ 973,714	\$ 19,650	2.0%	35,840	538
Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	\$ 745,000	\$ 1,219,340	163.7%	N/A	N/A
TOTAL	34,670	29,321	\$ 7,555,173	\$ 7,549,884	99.9%	149,862	110,318

* Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

The 2018 budget for the Weatherization Program assumed a total weighted cost of \$50.41 per saved Dth. The actual total weighted cost for these measures is \$68.44 per saved Dth.

THERMWISE LOW INCOME EFFICIENCY PROGRAM

The ThermWise Low Income Efficiency Program is funded at \$500,000. This \$500,000 is used to provide low-income qualified residences with energy efficient furnaces. The Low-Income Efficiency Tariff includes a paragraph allowing approved non-profit or governmental agencies to apply for rebates under the ThermWise Programs. This allows qualified agencies to utilize rebates for work they have performed to do additional weatherization measures. The Utah Department of Workforce Services' Housing and Community Development Division (HCD)

³ Ibid

currently qualifies under this provision. HCD reports its activity quarterly and includes the saved Dths as a result of its efforts as part of the report filed by the Company on the Energy Efficiency Program results.

**DOMINION ENERGY
LOW INCOME EFFICIENCY PROGRAM**

December 31, 2018
DOCKET NO. 19-057-07

Table 7

	2018 Estimated Participants	YTD Actual Participants	2018 Budget Cost	YTD Actual Costs	YTD \$ % of Budget	Budget Dth Savings	YTD Dth Savings*
95% Efficient Furnace	300	40	\$ 90,000	\$ 13,050	15%	4,920	655
95% and 98% Efficient Furnace with ECM	24	46	\$ 8,600	\$ 16,950	197%	394	650
Boilers Tier 1	0	1	\$ -	\$ 400	NB	0	19
Boilers Tier 2	0	1	\$ -	\$ 600	NB	0	25
Gas Water Heater - Tier 2	38	2	\$ 67,760	\$ 200	0%	120	8
Attic Insulation - Tier 1	220	183	\$ 9,240	\$ 30,269	328%	1,026	642
Attic Insulation Tier 2	120	79	\$ 10,224	\$ 1,194	12%	137	22
Floor Insulation	48	25	\$ 11,802	\$ 2,545	22%	278	87
Wall Insulation	40	79	\$ 21,850	\$ 11,137	51%	143	197
Duct Sealing & Insulation	50	-	\$ 81,050	\$ -	0%	539	0
Air Sealing	280	143	\$ 3,800	\$ 57,656	1517%	1,415	1153
Tank Less Gas Water Heater - Tier 2	5	-	\$ 1,750	\$ -	0%	38	0
Low Income Furnace Replacement	600	317	\$ 500,000	\$ 500,000	100%	12,300	6499
Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	\$ 23,350	\$ 8,054	34%	N/A	N/A
TOTAL	1,725	916	\$ 829,426	\$ 642,055	77.4%	21,311	9,957

* Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

Table 7 shows the results for the ThermWise Low Income Efficiency Program. The table shows that 77% of the total budget has been spent. The 2018 budget for the Low Income Efficiency Program assumed a total weighted cost of \$38.92 per saved Dth, the actual total weighted cost for those the measures implemented was \$64.48 per saved Dth.

Conclusion

The Division acknowledges the success of the Energy Efficiency Programs initiated by Dominion Energy as they benefit all rate payers by reducing natural gas usage levels. As indicted in Table 6, ThermWise Weatherization, Air Sealing appears to be a program measure that needs evaluated due to actual costs exceeding budget costs by 3271% with participation at 3308% of budget. The Division requests that the Company discuss these results at a future 2019 Advisory Group meeting.

The Division commends DEU and the Advisory Group for their active participation and commitment to continue to develop and promote strong Energy Efficiency Programs, with the intent to promote the energy saving measures to an even broader base of GS customers and urges all GS customers to participate in these programs whenever possible.

Cc: Michael Orton, Dominion Energy Utah
Michele Beck, Office of Consumer Services