



GARY HERBERT  
*Governor*

SPENCER J. COX  
*Lieutenant Governor*

## State of Utah

### Department of Commerce Division of Public Utilities

CHRIS PARKER  
*Interim Executive Director*

CHRIS PARKER  
*Director, Division of Public Utilities*

## Action Request Response

**To:** Public Service Commission of Utah

**From:** Utah Division of Public Utilities

Chris Parker, Director

Artie Powell, Manager

Brenda Salter, Utility Technical Consultant Supervisor

Shauna Benvegnu-Springer, Utility Technical Consultant

**Date:** April 29, 2020

**Re:** **Docket Nos. 20-057-01, 19-057-07 & 18-057-20**, Division's Review of Dominion Energy's Energy Efficiency Report for Year Ending December 31, 2019

### Recommendation (Acknowledge)

The Division of Public Utilities (Division) provides these comments to the Public Service Commission (Commission) regarding Dominion Energy Utah's (DEU) Energy Efficiency year-end report for 2019. The Division recommends the Commission acknowledge the filing of the 2019 report.

### Issue

On March 27, 2020, DEU filed its Energy Efficiency Report for the year ending December 31, 2019. On March 30, 2020, the Commission issued an Action Request to the Division requesting a review for compliance of the year ending December 31, 2019 and to make any recommendations by April 29, 2020.

## **Background**

On October 16, 2018, DEU filed an application, Docket No. 18-057-20, seeking approval of the 2019 year budget for Energy Efficiency (EE ) Programs and Market Transformation Initiative (MTI) in compliance with the Commission's orders in Docket No 05-057-T01 and Docket No. 09-057-16. DEU requested \$25.508 million for their EE and MTI programs. On December 31, 2018, the Commission issued an order authorizing DEU to continue to offer to customers in the GS race class EE programs and continuation of the MTI for 2019 with a budget of \$25.508 million effective January 1, 2019.

The Division commends DEU and the Advisory Group for their active participation and commitment to continue to develop and promote strong Energy Efficiency Programs, with the intent to promote the energy saving measures to an even broader base of GS customers and urges all GS customers to participate in these programs whenever possible.

The purpose of this report is to provide the 2019 year end actual results compared to the 2018 actual results and the 2019 EE and MTI budget, as approved by the Commission.

## **Discussion**

DEU administers eight separate EE programs designed to help customers improve the efficiency of their natural gas consumption. Six of the programs operate under the ThermWise protocols that include:

- 1) The ThermWise Appliance Rebates,
- 2) The ThermWise Builder Rebates,
- 3) The ThermWise Business Rebates,
- 4) The ThermWise Weatherization,
- 5) The ThermWise Home Energy Plan, and
- 6) The ThermWise Energy Comparison Report

The remaining two programs are:

- 7) The Low Income Efficiency, and

8) Market Transformation Initiative.

The Market Transformation Initiative helps educate natural gas customers on the benefits of reducing the consumption of natural gas on an ongoing basis. The ThermWise Home Energy Plan and the Market Transformation programs do not provide rebates. All of the other programs issue rebates for participants. The 2019 Energy Efficiency budget of \$25.5 million was an increase of \$1 million from the 2018 budget of \$24.5 million. The increase was not attributable to one particular program. The programs contain multiple measures designed to help consumers be more efficient at their consumption of natural gas.

**2019 THERMWISE PROGRAM SUMMARY**

Table 1 below compares the 2018 and 2019 actual costs of the programs with the 2019 budget. Table 1 shows a total of \$23.6 million, or 92% of the \$25.5 million annual budget was spent. The table also shows that the expenditures resulted in 960,178 Dth of deemed savings during the year compared to an estimated budgeted deemed savings of 1,205,471 Dth. These savings include the deemed savings from the ThermWise Energy Comparison Report. There were 303,818 program participants during the year compared to an estimated 313,896 participants. The number of participants that received rebates dropped to 79,418 in 2019 from 88,852 in 2018.

Of the five economic tests that are useful in understanding program effectiveness, the Utility Cost Test (UCT) is recommended by the Commission as the threshold test in determining program prudence. Through informal requests, the Company provided the benefit cost ratios for the 2019 program year. The UCT for DEU's 2019 Energy Efficiency Program was 1.49.

In the EE account at the end of the calendar year, December 31, 2019, the balance reported a \$2,900,482 credit. DEU will incorporate the credit into the calculation of the 2021 EE amortization rate toward the end of the 2020 calendar year. The credit amount is a result of the timing between when rebates are submitted vs. the collection of the EE amortization rate.

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH  
Energy Efficiency Report  
As of December 31, 2019  
Docket No. 20-057-01

Table 1

Line #	Program	PARTICIPANTS			COSTS			%	Dth Savings*			UTC B/C
		Actual		Estimated	Actual		Budget	Act/Bgt	Actual	Actual	Budget	Ratio
		2018	2019	2019	2018	2019	2019	2019	2018	2019	Est 2019	2019
1	ThermWise Appliance Rebates	21,621	16,367	28,495	\$ 4,498,299	\$ 4,181,678	\$ 5,914,668	70.7%	174,790	132,954	277,307	1.58
2	ThermWise Builder Rebates	23,832	30,486	17,495	6,539,995	6,120,422	4,748,713	128.9%	129,883	173,390	138,769	1.54
3	ThermWise Business Rebates	1,000	2,217	1,911	1,951,901	2,674,073	3,619,448	73.9%	65,199	108,589	180,899	2.65
4	ThermWise Home Energy Plan	2,162	2,337	2,800	435,796	402,747	685,265	58.8%	34,845	33,970	45,207	1.17
5	ThermWise Weatherization Rebates	39,321	26,786	36,370	7,549,884	8,183,650	7,781,388	105.2%	110,318	135,079	168,178	2.19
8	Low Income Efficiency Program	916	1,225	2,425	642,055	713,724	868,950	82.1%	9,957	12,667	29,583	1.82
9	<b>Rebate Programs Total **</b>	<b>88,852</b>	<b>79,418</b>	<b>89,496</b>	<b>\$ 21,617,930</b>	<b>\$ 22,276,293</b>	<b>\$ 23,618,431</b>	<b>94.3%</b>	<b>524,992</b>	<b>596,650</b>	<b>839,943</b>	<b>1.49</b>
6	Market Transformation	N/A	N/A	N/A	1,374,666	852,478	1,320,000	64.6%	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
7	ThermWise Energy Comparison Report	285,000	224,400	224,400	415,686	452,026	570,000	79.3%	347,700	363,528	365,528	1.02
9	<b>Programs Total</b>	<b>373,852</b>	<b>303,818</b>	<b>313,896</b>	<b>\$ 23,408,282</b>	<b>\$ 23,580,797</b>	<b>\$ 25,508,431</b>	<b>92.4%</b>	<b>872,692</b>	<b>960,178</b>	<b>1,205,471</b>	<b>1.49</b>
10	DSM Interest				78,182	(20,771)						
11	DSM Amortization				(23,887,962)	(27,994,304)			\$ 37.34	\$ 28.12		
12	DSM Accruals ***				278,384	1,533,786						
13	DSM General Administration				-	-						
14	<b>TOTALS</b>				<b>\$ (123,114)</b>	<b>\$ (2,900,492)</b>						

\*Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

\*\* Total participation reflects rebates and energy plan participants. Energy Comparison Report participants are shown only for the purpose of calculating cost effectiveness.

\*\*\* Accruals made during the period are shown only for the purpose of reconciling ending account balance.

## THERMWISE APPLIANCE PROGRAM

Table 2 summarizes the ThermWise Appliance Program. This program rebated \$4.2 million, or 70.7% of the \$5.9 million budget. The Smart Thermostat incentive had the most participation with 6,097 participants, but down from 12,000 participants in 2018. The 95% Efficient Furnace with ECM rebated \$1.6 million, which rebated the most dollars for 2019. This rebate incentive spent 172.9% of its 2019 budget of \$945,000.<sup>1</sup> Due to the mix of measures chosen in 2019, the actual total weighted cost was \$31.45 per saved Dth, which was up from the 2018 actual total weighted cost of \$25.74 per saved Dth.

<sup>1</sup> Docket No. 18-057-20, Application for Approval of the 2019 Year Budget for Energy Efficiency Programs and Market Transformation Initiative, filed October 16, 2018.

**DOMINION ENERGY UTAH**  
**ThermWise Appliance Rebates**  
**As of December 31, 2019**  
**Docket No. 20-057-01**  
**Table 2**

Line#	Program			COSTS		%	Dth Savings	
		2019	Estimated 2019	Actual 2019	Budget 2019	Act/Bgt 2019	Actual 2019	C/Dth 2019
1	92% Efficient Furnace	13	-	\$ 2,600	\$ -	N/A	101	\$ 25.80
2	95% Efficient Furnace	2,002	6,300	600,650	1,890,000	31.8%	18,858	\$ 31.85
3	95% Efficient Furnace with ECM	4,667	2,700	1,633,550	945,000	172.9%	43,958	\$ 37.16
4	98% Efficient Furnace with ECM	744	600	297,600	240,000	124.0%	8,244	\$ 36.10
5	Gas Water Heater - Tier 2	598	700	59,800	70,000	85.4%	1,368	\$ 43.71
6	Condensing Gas Water Heater	91	110	31,850	38,500	82.7%	632	\$ 50.40
7	Hybrid Gas Water Heater	22	30	7,700	10,500	73.3%	153	\$ 50.40
8	Boilers Tier 1	12	8	4,800	3,200	150.0%	180	\$ 26.74
9	Boilers Tier 2	82	180	49,200	108,000	45.6%	1,653	\$ 29.76
10	Solar Assisted Water Heater (domestic)	1	7	750	5,250	14.3%	14	\$ 53.57
11	Solar Assisted Water Heater (pool)	4	10	3,000	7,500	40.0%	220	\$ 13.61
12	Tankless Gas Water Heater (tier 2)	1,152	850	360,150	255,000	141.2%	8,635	\$ 41.71
13	Direct Vent Gas Fireplace	575	600	115,000	120,000	95.8%	4,968	\$ 23.15
14	Smart Thermostat (appliance)	6,097	15,000	305,050	750,000	40.7%	41,947	\$ 7.27
15	Boiler Reset Control (appliance)	5	5	500	500	100.0%	22	\$ 23.15
16	Combined Space and Hot Water (appliance)	23	-	17,250	-	N/A	350	\$ 49.34
17	95% Efficient Furnace	62	1,000	18,600	300,000	6.2%	436	\$ 42.61
18	95% Efficient Furnace with ECM	97	100	33,950	35,000	97.0%	683	\$ 49.72
19	98% Efficient Furnace with ECM	-	5	-	2,000	0.0%	-	N/A
20	Gas Water Heater - Tier 2	2	80	200	8,000	2.5%	5	\$ 43.71
21	Solar Assisted Water Heater (pool)	-	1	-	750	0.0%	-	N/A
22	Condensing Gas Water Heater	2	-	700	-	N/A	9	\$81.02
23	Boilers Tier 1	-	1	-	400	0.0%	-	N/A
24	Boilers Tier 2	-	1	-	600	0.0%	-	N/A
25	Direct Vent Gas Fireplace	1	1	200	200	100.0%	3	
26	Smart Thermostat (existing multifamily)	23	200	1,150	10,000	11.5%	74	
27	Combined Space and Hot Water (existing)	-	5	-	3,750	0.0%	-	
28	Tankless Gas Water Heater (tier 1)	92	1	27,600	300	9200.0%	442	
29	Incentive Accruals	-	-	-	-	N/A	-	
30	Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	609,828	1,110,218	54.9%	N/A	
31	<b>Total</b>	<b>16,367</b>	<b>28,495</b>	<b>4,181,678</b>	<b>5,914,668</b>	<b>70.7%</b>	<b>132,954</b>	<b>\$ 31.45</b>

\*Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

## **THERMWISE BUILDER PROGRAM**

The ThermWise Builder Program is designed to offer builders who use energy efficient construction techniques for specific rebates. The program is available to residential builders in the Company's Utah service territory and includes rebates for installing natural gas energy-efficiency measures in newly constructed single and multifamily residences receiving service on the GS rate schedule.

As shown in Table 3, the Builder Program rebated 128.9%, or \$6.1 million of the 2019 budget of \$4.7 million. The 2019 rebates were lower compared to 2018 rebates of \$6.5 million.

The 95% High-Efficiency Gas Furnace incentive, for single family, maintain the greatest participation rate with 7,186 participants, as well as \$2.1 million dollars rebated. The 95% Efficient Furnace with MF (multi-family) incentive came in second with 3,809 actual participants and redeemed rebates of \$1.1 million. The overspending of the 2019 budget by \$1.3 million is largely attributed to spending of the multi-family construction incentives of \$2,092,134 with a budget of \$551,300 (see lines 21 through 37, Table 3). There were savings in other measures, but not enough to cover \$1.3 million. The 2020 budget addressed this issue by funding the measures appropriately.

The Builder Program had actual total weighted cost measures of \$35.30 per saved Dth, which is lower than the actual weighted cost of \$44.16 per saved Dth in 2018.

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH  
Builder Rebates Program  
As of December 31, 2019  
Docket No. 20-057-01  
Table 3

Line#	Program	Participants		Costs		% Dth Savings*		
		Actual 2019	Estimated 2019	Actual 2019	Budget 2019	Act/Bgt 2019	Actual 2019	C/Dth 2019
1	HERS Index 62 or lower (builder)	1,382	1,600	\$ 138,200	\$ 160,000	86.4%	5,749	\$ 24.04
2	HERS Index 55 or lower (builder)	1,870	600	374,000	120,000	311.7%	15,558	\$ 24.04
3	HERS Index 48 or lower (builder)	193	10	57,900	3,000	1930.0%	2,409	\$ 24.04
4	Energy Star 3.0 Bonus (builder)	867	600	43,350	30,000	144.5%	1,928	\$ 22.48
5	92% Efficient Furnace	105	-	21,000	-	#DIV/0!	680	\$ 30.86
6	95% Efficient Furnace	7,186	8,500	2,159,050	2,550,000	84.7%	58,291	\$ 37.04
7	95% Efficient Furnace with ECM	1,740	1,000	609,100	350,000	174.0%	14,103	\$ 43.19
8	98% Efficient Furnace with ECM	23	20	9,350	8,000	116.9%	224	\$ 41.71
9	.67 EF Storage Water Heater	1,534	515	153,400	51,500	297.9%	3,510	\$ 43.71
10	Tankless Water Heater Tier 2	1,318	110	419,800	33,000	1272.1%	11,282	\$ 37.21
11	Condensing Gas Water Heater	65	10	22,750	3,500	650.0%	451	\$ 50.40
12	Hybrid Gas Water Heater	-	5	-	1,750	0.0%	-	
13	Gas Boiler Rebates Paid - Tier 1	2	9	800	3,600	22.2%	14	\$ 55.19
14	Gas Boiler Rebates Paid - Tier 2	34	33	20,400	19,800	103.0%	438	\$ 46.55
15	Solar Assisted Water Heater - domestic	-	5	-	3,750	0.0%	-	
16	Solar Assisted Water Heater - pool	-	5	-	3,750	0.0%	-	
17	2X6 R-23 Walls	2,949	1,200	442,350	180,000	245.8%	12,740	\$ 34.72
18	R-5 Window	14	200	16,312	500	3262.4%	151	\$ 107.76
19	Smart Thermostat (builder)	390	450	19,600	22,500	87.1%	1,342	\$ 14.61
20	Combined Space and Hot Water (builder)	2	5	1,500	3,750	40.0%	29	\$ 51.23
21	HERS Index 62 or lower - MF	1,173	10	58,650	500	11730.0%	2,158	\$ 27.17
22	HERS Index 55 or lower - MF	1,253	-	125,300	-		4,611	\$ 27.17
23	HERS Index 48 or lower - MF	626	-	93,900	-		3,456	\$ 27.17
24	Energy Star 3.0 Bonus - MF	792	-	19,800	-		716	\$ 27.65
25	Pay for Performance	290	-	107,284	-		1,856	\$ 57.80
26	92% Efficient Furnace - MF	23	-	4,600	-		112	\$ 40.98
27	95% Efficient Furnace - MF	3,809	1,500	1,156,050	450,000	256.9%	22,924	\$ 50.43
28	95% Efficient Furnace with ECM - MF	186	33	65,100	11,550	563.6%	1,131	\$ 57.57
29	98% Efficient Furnace with ECM - MF	9	5	3,600	2,000	180.0%	66	\$ 54.95
30	.67 EF Storage Water Heater - MF	1,265	715	126,500	71,500	176.9%	1,407	\$ 89.93
31	Tankless Water Heater Tier 2 - MF	966	5	303,500	1,500	20233.3%	5,216	\$ 58.18
32	Condensing Gas Water Heater - MF	71	-	24,850	-		307	\$ 81.02
33	Hybrid Gas Water Heater - MF	-	5	-	1,750	0.0%	-	
34	Boilers Tier 1 - MF	-	5	-	2,000	0.0%	-	
35	Boilers Tier 2 - MF	5	5	3,000	3,000	100.0%	64	\$ 46.55
36	Solar Assisted Water Heater - domestic MF	-	5	-	3,750	0.0%	-	
37	Solar Assisted Water Heater - pool MF	-	5	-	3,750	0.0%	-	
38	R-5 Window	-	5	-	13	0.0%	-	
39	Smart Thermostat (new multifamily)	340	5	30,200	250	12080.0%	462	\$ 65.31
40	Combined Space and Hot Water (new multifamily)	-	15	-	11,250	0.0%	-	
41	Energy Star Highrise (new multifamily)	4	300	100	7,500	1.3%	4	\$ 27.65
42	Incentive Accrual	-	-	(885,000)	-		-	
43	Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	374,125	630,000	59.4%	N/A	\$ -
44	<b>Total</b>	<b>30,486</b>	<b>17,495</b>	<b>\$ 6,120,422</b>	<b>\$ 4,748,713</b>	<b>128.9%</b>	<b>173,390</b>	<b>\$ 35.30</b>

\*Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

## THERMWISE BUSINESS PROGRAM

In the ThermWise Business Program, there are over 57 prescriptive measures available to commercial entities to improve their energy efficiency. Table 4 provides the detail of those measures. There were 19 measures that had \$10,000 or more of rebate incentive costs. The rebate expense of these 19 measures is \$1.6 million, which accounts for 44.2% of the rebates paid in this program. For the year, the total program spent 74% of the annual budget. The 2019 actual cost per deemed Dth was \$24.63 compared to the 2018 actual cost of \$29.94.

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH  
Business Rebates Program  
As of December 31, 2019  
Docket No. 20-057-01  
Table 4

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2019	Budget 2019	Actual 2019	Budget 2019	% of Budget	Actual 2019	C/Dth 2019
1	Business Custom	30	20	\$ 72,023	\$ 80,000	90.0%	7,720	\$ 9.33
2	95% Efficient Furnace	517	500	155,100	150,000	103.4%	4,868	\$ 31.86
3	95% Efficient Furnace with ECM	214	200	74,900	70,000	107.0%	2,015	\$ 37.17
4	98% Efficient Furnace with ECM	12	10	4,800	4,000	120.0%	133	\$ 36.10
5	Gas Storage Water Heater - Tier 2 <75kBtu .67	3	5	300	500	60.0%	7	\$ 41.25
6	Gas Storage Water Heater >75kBtu	162	50	107,576	30,000	358.6%	12,479	\$ 8.62
7	High Efficiency Gas Water Heater - Tankless <200kBTU	38	5	27,680	2,000	1384.0%	1,952	\$ 14.18
8	High Efficiency Gas Water Heater - Tankless >200kBTU	49	25	33,091	25,500	129.8%	2,334	\$ 14.18
9	Condensing Gas Water Heater	3	3	1,050	1,050	100.0%	24	\$ 42.89
10	Hybrid Gas Water Heater	2	5	700	1,750	40.0%	16	\$ 42.89
11	Combined Space / Water Heater (business)	1	5	450	2,250	20.0%	15	\$ 30.08
12	Commercial Clothes Washer	12	1	900	75	1200.0%	25	\$ 36.06
13	Boiler Reset Control	3	30	750	7,500	10.0%	178	\$ 4.22
14	Boiler Tune-up Tier 1	2	25	200	2,500	8.0%	31	\$ 6.38
15	Boiler Tune-up Tier 2	3	25	600	5,000	12.0%	117	\$ 5.12
16	Boiler Tune-up Tier 3	18	50	4,550	15,000	30.3%	1,274	\$ 3.57
17	Low Flow Pre-rinse Spray Valve	-	25	-	800	0.0%	-	
18	Smart Thermostat (business)	396	200	9,534	14,000	68.1%	763	\$ 12.50
19	Direct Contact Water Heater	-	1	-	298	0.0%	-	
20	Direct Fired Heater	15	75	89,616	90,000	99.6%	9,894	\$ 9.06
21	High Efficiency Boiler Hot Water Tier 1	13	25	19,406	100,000	19.4%	1,394	\$ 13.92
22	High Efficiency Boiler Hot Water Tier 2	133	75	886,912	304,688	291.1%	43,663	\$ 20.31
23	Boiler Hot Water ≥ 2,500,000 Btu/h (business)	-	115	-	1,121,250	0.0%	-	
24	High Efficiency Boiler Steam Tier 1	-	1	-	4,140	0.0%	-	
25	High Efficiency Boiler Steam Tier 2	6		47,352			6,440	\$ 7.35
26	Boiler Steam (Except Natural Draft) ≥ 300,000 Btu/h (bus	-	2	-	21,612	0.0%	-	
27	Boiler Steam (Natural Draft) ≥ 300,000 Btu/h (business)	4	10	20,456	108,060	18.9%	982	\$ 20.83
28	Gas Unit Heater NonCondensing	-	10	-	16,200	0.0%	-	
29	Gas Unit Heater Condensing	2	10	1,228	2,500	49.1%	28	\$ 44.21
30	Infrared Heating System	7	50	3,025	37,500	8.1%	233	\$ 12.98



DOMINION ENERGY UTAH  
Business Rebates Program  
As of December 31, 2019  
Docket No. 20-057-01  
Table 4 (continued)

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2019	Budget 2019	Actual 2019	Budget 2019	% of Budget	Actual 2019	C/Dth 2019
31	Modulating Infrared Heaters (NC or Replacing Non-IR)	14	40	16,500	43,500	37.9%	968	\$ 17.05
32	Modulating Infrared Heaters (Replacing Non-IR) (business)	100	20	51,250	5,800	883.6%	1,435	\$ 35.71
33	Condensing RTU's (business)	-	1	-	1,875	0.0%	-	
34	High Efficiency Gas Combo Oven	21	8	21,000	8,000	262.5%	677	\$ 31.02
35	High Efficiency Gas Combo Oven (Used)	-	8	-	4,000	0.0%	-	
36	Energy Star Gas Commercial Fryer	17	25	8,500	18,750	45.3%	549	\$ 15.47
37	Energy Star Gas Commercial Fryer (Used)	-	15	-	5,625	0.0%	-	
38	High Efficiency Gas Convection Oven	67	25	33,500	18,750	178.7%	1,810	\$ 18.51
39	High Efficiency Gas Convection Oven (Used)	-	15	-	5,625	0.0%	-	
40	High Efficiency Gas Griddle	1	5	300	1,500	20.0%	12	\$ 25.17
41	High Efficiency Gas Griddle (Used)	-	5	-	750	0.0%	-	
42	Energy Star Gas Steam Cooker	10	2	10,000	2,000	500.0%	706	\$ 14.16
43	Energy Star Gas Steam Cooker (Used)	-	2	-	1,000	0.0%	-	
44	Attic Insulation (retrofit)	13	50	13,052	56,000	23.3%	300	\$ 43.48
45	Wall Insulation (retrofit)	2	5	125	6,000	2.1%	3	\$ 41.44
46	Demand Control Ventilation Systems	5	50	27,466	20,000	137.3%	747	\$ 36.76
47	Demand Control Ventilation Systems (DCV) Packaged (retrofit)	168	5	67,200	5,000	1344.0%	3,656	\$ 18.38
48	Pipe Insulation (Hot Water)	-	10	-	750	0.0%	-	
49	Pipe Insulation (Steam)	-	5	-	1,000	0.0%	-	
50	High Efficiency Charbroiler	-	5	-	5,000	0.0%	-	
51	High Efficiency Charbroiler (Used)	-	5	-	2,500	0.0%	-	
52	Conveyor Oven	-	2	-	2,000	0.0%	-	
53	Conveyor Oven (Used)	-	2	-	1,000	0.0%	-	
54	Gas Dryer Moisture Sensor	-	1	-	25	0.0%	-	
55	Modulating Gas Dryer	1	1	75	75	100.0%	26	\$ 2.93
56	Solar Assisted Water Heater- Pool- Business	-	1	-	750	0.0%	-	
57	Prescriptive ERV	153	40	94,291	4,000	2357.3%	1,114	\$ 84.65
58	Incentive Accrual	-	-	-	-		-	
59	Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	768,617	1,180,000	65.1%	N/A	\$ -
60	<b>Total</b>	<b>2,217</b>	<b>1,911</b>	<b>\$ 2,674,073</b>	<b>\$ 3,619,448</b>	<b>73.9%</b>	<b>108,589</b>	<b>\$ 24.63</b>

\*Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

## THERMWISE HOME ENERGY PLAN PROGRAM

The ThermWise Home Energy Plan Program is designed to give customers an opportunity to have their current energy efficiency efforts evaluated, with suggestions offered on ways to improve those efforts. The home energy plans can either be an on-site audit, conducted by a qualified DEU technician or a mail in audit in which the participants answer questions and receive advice from DEU. This program continues to have benefits in addition to those seen in the data below as it introduces customers to the potential savings they may realize by

implementing additional energy efficiency measures. Table 5 shows Dth savings in 2019 was 33,970, slightly down from 34,845 in 2018.

**DOMINION ENERGY UTAH**  
**Home Energy Plans Program**  
**As of December 31, 2019**  
**Docket No. 20-057-01**  
**Table 5**

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2019	Budget 2019	Actual 2019	Budget 2019	% of Budget	Dth Savings*	C/Dth 2019
1	THERMWISE HOME ENERGY PLAN							
2	Efficiency Measures	2,337	2,800	\$ 27,789	\$ 52,265	53.2%	33,970	\$ 0.82
3	Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	374,958	633,000	59.2%	N/A	
4	<b>Total</b>	<b>2,337</b>	<b>2,800</b>	<b>\$ 402,747</b>	<b>\$ 685,265</b>	<b>58.8%</b>	<b>33,970</b>	<b>\$ 11.86</b>

\*Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

\*\*Participants, Plans Completed and Efficiency Items are based on reported numbers from the ThermWise Home Energy Experts.

## THERMWISE WEATHERIZATION PROGRAM

Table 6 summarizes the results for the ThermWise Weatherization Program. Weatherization projects were the highest rebated measures of the DEUs Energy Efficiency Program and increased from 2018 levels by 35%. The Weatherization Program reached 105.2% of budgeted expenditures, high than the 2018 Weatherization Program that reached 99.9% of budgeted expenditures. The primary drivers of the program were Air Sealing and Attic Insulation Tier 1 & Tier 2. Air Sealing appears to be a program measure that should continue to be evaluated in subsequent budget filings as actual costs were 455.3% of budget with participation at 413% of estimated participants. The Company's 2020 budget filing<sup>2</sup> increased the air sealing budgeted levels of participation in 2020. The Division recommends the Company address these results at a future 2020 Advisory Group meeting.

The 2019 actual total weighted cost for these measures is \$60.58 per saved Dth, which is a reduction from \$68.44 actual total weighted cost per saved Dth in 2018.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid.

**DOMINION ENERGY UTAH**  
**Weatherization Rebates Program**  
**As of December 31, 2019**  
**Docket No. 20-057-01**

**Table 6**

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2019	Budget 2019	Actual 2019	Budget 2019	% of Budget	Actual 2019	C/Dth
1	Attic Insulation Tier 1 - .25 per sq. ft	10,788	9,000	\$ 2,098,977	\$ 3,150,000	66.6%	35,599	\$ 58.96
2	Attic Insulation Tier 2	4,152	2,500	281,192	245,000	114.8%	4,178	\$ 67.31
3	Floor Insulation	102	200	19,469	32,800	59.4%	530	\$ 36.76
4	Wall Insulation	476	600	138,488	154,800	89.5%	1,957	\$ 70.75
5	R-5 Windows	1,024	12,000	471,709	450,000	104.8%	10,536	\$ 44.77
6	Duct Sealing & Insulation	203	800	57,302	335,385	17.1%	2,189	\$ 26.18
7	Air Sealing	8,266	2,000	3,923,947	861,840	455.3%	62,783	\$ 62.50
8	Pipe Insulation (weatherization)	-	800	-	2,000	0.0%	-	
9	ICAST pilot	1,721	1,000	361,213	450,000	80.3%	17,210	\$ 20.99
10	Attic Insulation Tier 1 (multifamily) - .25 per sq. ft	34	4,000	3,407	989,355	0.3%	58	\$ 58.96
11	Attic Insulation (multifamily) Tier 2	17	2,200	954	148,672	0.6%	14	\$ 67.31
12	Floor Insulation (multifamily)	-	20	-	364	0.0%	-	
13	Wall Insulation (multifamily)	-	10	-	1,020	0.0%	-	
14	R-5 Windows (multifamily)	3	40	1,147	1,500	76.5%	26	\$ 44.77
15	Duct Sealing & Insulation (multifamily)	-	1,200	-	208,653	0.0%	-	
16	Incentive Accruals	-	-	-	-		-	
17	Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	825,845	750,000	110.1%	N/A	
18	<b>Total</b>	<b>26,786</b>	<b>36,370</b>	<b>\$ 8,183,650</b>	<b>\$ 7,781,388</b>	<b>105.2%</b>	<b>135,079</b>	<b>\$ 60.58</b>

\*Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

**THERMWISE MARKET TRANSFORMATION PROGRAM**

Table 7 shows the ThermWise Market Transformation program costs were 64.6% of the expected 2019 levels. Costs decreased considerably from \$1.374 million in 2018 to \$852,478 in 2019. The difference between the budget and the expenses is \$467,522.

DEU's Market Transformation program was working with Habit for Humanity (HH). In the HH program, funding for projects must be obtained prior to construction, unlike builder homes that are sold after completion. The cost of participating with HH was overestimated by \$190,000 because the assumptions were similar to other building projects, instead of charity building projects. The Company was not able to participate in the same amount of projects.

DEU operates a fall preparation program that provides messages to customers about preparing natural gas devices for winter operation. Transactions of the program totaling \$277,500 were recorded incorrectly for 2019, causing an accounting adjustment.

**DOMINION ENERGY UTAH**  
**Market Transformation**  
**As of December 31, 2019**  
**Docket No. 20-057-01**

**Table 7**

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2019	Budget 2019	Actual 2019	Budget 2019	% of Budget	Actual 2019	Average Weight
1	Market Transformation Total	N/A	N/A	\$ 852,478	\$ 1,320,000	64.6%	N/A	N/A

**THERMWISE ENERGY COMPARISON REPORT**

Table 8 shows the ThermWise Energy Comparison Report cost \$452,025, which represents 79.3% of the expected 2019 level of \$570,000. This was slightly more than the 2018 amount of \$415,686. Current distribution of the energy comparison reports is to approximately 224,400 participants, down from 285,000 customers in 2018. The report is available to customers via opt-in and opt-out programs. Considering the 2019 deemed Dth savings of 363,528, the total actual weighted cost of \$1.24 per saved Dth is considered commendable.

**DOMINION ENERGY UTAH**  
**Energy Comparison**  
**As of December 31, 2019**  
**Docket No. 20-057-01**

**Table 8**

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2019	Budget 2019	Actual 2019	Budget 2019	% of Budget	Actual 2019	C/Dth 2019
1	Energy Comparison Report Total	224,400	224,400	\$ 452,026	\$ 570,000	79.3%	363,528	\$ 1.24

**THERMWISE LOW INCOME EFFICIENCY PROGRAM**

Table 9 illustrates the designed incentives and measures for low income participants. The ThermWise Low Income Efficiency Program is funded at \$868,950. The program has \$500,000 to provide low-income qualified residences with energy efficient furnaces. The Low-Income Efficiency Tariff includes a paragraph allowing approved non-profit or governmental agencies to apply for rebates under the ThermWise Programs. This allows qualified agencies to utilize rebates for work they have performed to do additional weatherization measures. The Utah Department of Workforce Services' Housing and Community Development Division (HCD)

currently qualifies under this provision. HCD reports its activity quarterly and includes the saved Dths as a result of its efforts as part of the report filed by the Company on the Energy Efficiency Program results.

Table 9 shows the results for the ThermWise Low Income Efficiency Program. The table points out that 82% of the total budget was spent. The 2019 actual total weighted cost for the measures implemented was \$56.34 per saved Dth. The program increased its performance from 2018 total weight cost for the measures implemented of \$64.48 per saved Dth.

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH  
Low Income Efficiency  
As of December 31, 2019  
Docket No. 20-057-01  
Table 9

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual	Budget	Actual	Budget	% of Budget	Actual	C/Dth
		2019	2019	2019	2019	2019	2019	
1	95% Efficient Furnace	46	300	13,800	90,000	15.3%	541	\$ 25.49
2	95% Efficient Furnace with ECM	98	20	34,300	7,000	490.0%	1,153	\$ 29.74
3	98% Efficient Furnace with ECM	4	4	1,600	1,600	100.0%	55	\$ 28.88
4	Gas Water Heater - Tier 2	7	38	700	3,800	18.4%	28	\$ 25.25
5	Attic Insulation - Tier 1	253	220	45,871	67,760	67.7%	972	\$ 47.17
6	Attic Insulation Tier 2	114	120	1,896	9,240	20.5%	35	\$ 53.85
7	Floor Insulation	17	48	2,153	10,224	21.1%	73	\$ 29.41
8	Wall Insulation	75	40	12,686	11,802	107.5%	224	\$ 56.60
9	Duct Sealing & Insulation	-	50	-	20,962	0.0%	-	
10	Air Sealing	221	280	88,973	81,050	109.8%	1,779	\$ 50.00
11	Tank Less Gas Water Heater - Tier 2 (low income)	-	5	-	1,750	0.0%	-	
12	Smart Thermostat (low income)	16	700	800	35,000	2.3%	138	\$ 5.81
13	Low Income Furnace Replacement	374	600	500,000	500,000	100.0%	7,667	\$ 65.21
14	Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	10,945	28,763	38.1%	N/A	\$ -
15	<b>Total</b>	<b>1,225</b>	<b>2,425</b>	<b>\$ 713,724</b>	<b>\$ 868,950</b>	<b>82.1%</b>	<b>12,667</b>	<b>\$ 56.34</b>

## Conclusion

The Division acknowledges the success of the Energy Efficiency Programs initiated by Dominion Energy as they benefit all rate payers by reducing natural gas usage levels. The Division recommends the Commission acknowledge the EE Program report for the year ending December 31, 2019.

cc: Michael Orton, Dominion Energy Utah  
Michele Beck, Office of Consumer Services