



SPENCER J. COX
Governor

DEIDRE M. HENDERSON
Lieutenant Governor

UTAH DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

Division of Public Utilities

MARGARET W. BUSSE
Executive Director

CHRIS PARKER
Division Director

Action Request Response

To: Public Service Commission of Utah

From: Utah Division of Public Utilities

Chris Parker, Director
Brenda Salter, Assistant Director
Abdinasir Abdulle, Utility Technical Consultant Supervisor
Shauna Benvegnu-Springer, Utility Technical Consultant

Date: March 16, 2023

Re: **Docket No. 23-057-05** Dominion Energy Utah's Energy Efficiency Report for the Year Ending December 31, 2022

Docket No. 22-057-01 Dominion Energy Utah's Energy Efficiency Reports, 2022

Docket No. 21-057-25 Dominion Energy Utah's Application for Approval of the 2022 Year budget for Energy Efficiency Programs and Market Transformation Initiative

Recommendation (Acknowledge)

The Division of Public Utilities (Division) provides these comments to the Public Service Commission of Utah (Commission) regarding Dominion Energy Utah's (DEU) Energy Efficiency year-end report for 2022. The Division recommends that the Commission acknowledge the filing of the 2022 report.

Issue

On February 14, 2023, DEU filed its Energy Efficiency (EE) Report for the year ending December 31, 2022. On February 15, 2023, the Commission issued an Action Request to the Division requesting a review for compliance of the report for the year ending December 31, 2022, and to make any recommendations by March 16, 2023.

Division of Public Utilities

Heber M. Wells Building • 160 East 300 South • P.O. Box 146751 Salt Lake City, UT 84114-6741
www.dpu.utah.gov • telephone (801) 530-7622 • toll-free in Utah (877) 874-0904 • fax (801) 530-6512

Background

On October 26, 2021, DEU filed an application, Docket No. 21-057-25, seeking approval of the 2022-year budget for Energy Efficiency Programs and Market Transformation Initiative (MTI) in compliance with the Commission's orders in Docket No 05-057-T01 and Docket No. 09-057-16. DEU requested \$30.2 million for its EE and MTI programs. On December 20, 2021, the Commission issued an order authorizing DEU to continue offering GS rate customers EE programs and restart the MTI for 2022 with a total budget of \$30.2 million, effective January 1, 2022.

The Division commends DEU and the Advisory Group for their active participation and commitment to continue developing and promoting vital Energy Efficiency Programs to promote energy-saving measures to an even broader base of GS customers. It urges all GS customers to participate in these programs whenever possible.

This report aims to provide the 2022 year-end actual results compared to the 2021 year-end actual results and the 2022 EE and MTI budget, as approved by the Commission.

Discussion

DEU administers eight separate EE programs designed to help customers improve the efficiency of their natural gas consumption. Six of the programs operate under the ThermWise® protocols that include:

- 1) The ThermWise® Appliance Rebates,
- 2) The ThermWise® Builder Rebates,
- 3) The ThermWise® Business Rebates,
- 4) The ThermWise® Weatherization,
- 5) The ThermWise® Home Energy Plan, and
- 6) The ThermWise® Energy Comparison Report.

The remaining two programs are:

- 7) The Low-Income Efficiency Program, and
- 8) Market Transformation Initiative (MTI).

The Market Transformation Initiative helps educate customers about the benefits of continuously reducing natural gas consumption. MTI utilizes media such as television commercials, outreach programs, home show tours, etc., to make the public aware of the programs. The ThermWise® Home Energy Plan and the MTI do not provide rebates. All the other programs issue rebates for participants. The 2022 Energy Efficiency budget of \$30.2 million increased by \$3.1 million from the 2021 budget of \$27.1 million. The increase was not attributable to one program. The programs contain multiple measures designed to help consumers be more efficient at consuming natural gas.

2022 THERMWISE® PROGRAM SUMMARY

Table 1 compares the 2021 and 2022 actual costs with the 2022 budget. It shows that \$24.9 million was spent, or 82.4% of the \$30.2 million annual budget.

TABLE 1 - Summary of Programs

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH
Energy Efficiency Report
As of December 31, 2022
Docket No. 21-057-25, 22-057-01, & 23-057-05

Line #	Program	PARTICIPANTS			COSTS			%	Dth Savings*		C/Dth
		Actual		Estimated	Actual		Budget	Act/Bgt	Actual	Actual	
		2021	2022	2022	2021	2022	2022	2022	2021	2022	
1	ThermWise Appliance Rebates	13,114	11,212	19,339	\$ 4,296,595	\$ 3,918,453	\$ 6,168,350	69.7%	122,473	109,352	\$ 35.83
2	ThermWise Builder Rebates	19,322	17,140	25,836	7,906,644	8,983,698	9,503,060	83.2%	191,313	233,101	\$ 38.54
3	ThermWise Business Rebates	1,359	796	1,958	2,915,571	2,190,862	3,379,343	86.3%	81,509	84,536	\$ 25.92
4	ThermWise Home Energy Plan	1,722	1,999	2,240	364,320	325,726	508,467	71.7%	26,458	29,086	\$ 11.20
5	ThermWise Weatherization Rebates	21,273	21,110	32,385	7,543,060	7,100,096	8,040,274	93.8%	110,517	86,523	\$ 82.06
6	Low Income Efficiency Program	978	1,172	1,612	663,436	689,693	749,519	88.5%	9,614	9,325	\$ 73.96
7	Rebate Programs Total **	57,768	53,429	83,370	\$ 23,689,626	\$ 23,208,528	\$ 28,349,013	81.9%	541,884	551,911	\$ 42.05
8	Market Transformation	N/A	N/A	N/A	980,669	1,208,504	1,320,000	74.3%	N/A	N/A	
9	ThermWise Energy Comparison Report	226,000	228,000	228,000	493,875	477,746	544,000	90.8%	284,760	291,840	\$ 1.64
10	DSM Accruals ***				(135,237)						
11	Programs Total	283,768	281,429	311,370	25,028,933	24,894,778	30,213,013	82.4%	826,644	843,751	\$ 29.50
12	DSM Interest				13,627	(95,727)					
13	DSM Amortization				(24,500,335)	(29,176,620)					
14	DSM General Administration				-	-					
15	TOTALS				\$ 542,225	\$ (4,377,569)					

*Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

** Total participation reflects rebates and energy plan participants. Energy Comparison Report participants are shown only for the purpose of calculating cost effectiveness.

*** Accruals made during the period are shown only for the purpose of reconciling ending account balance.

Items highlighted balance to DEU Energy Efficiency Report for period ending December 31 2022.

The table also shows that the expenditures resulted in 843,751 Dth of deemed savings during the year. These savings include the savings from the ThermWise® Energy Comparison Report. There were 281,429 program participants during the year compared to 311,370 participants. The number of participants that received rebates dropped to 53,429 in 2022 from 57,768 in 2021.

Table 1 on line 15 illustrates that a credit of \$4,377,569 is the net effect of the over-collected revenues and lower customer incentives. The approved rates in 2023 for this program were designed to bring the account balance as close to zero as possible. The \$4,377,569 change in the account balance demonstrates and confirms the need to lower the amortization rate, as discussed and recommended in October 2023 budget application.

THERMWISE® APPLIANCE PROGRAM

Table 2 summarizes the ThermWise® Appliance Program. This program rebated \$3.3 million (less administrative overhead of \$601,453), or 63.5% of the \$6.2 million budget.

The 95% Efficient Furnace incentive participation was substantially below anticipated, with 4,404 participants, down from an estimated 8,500 participants. Rebates for the 95% Efficient Furnace incentive provided the most dollars for 2022 at \$1.3 million. This rebate incentive spent 51.8% of its 2022 budget of \$2,550,000. Due to the mix of measures chosen in 2022, the total weighted cost was \$35.83 per saved Dth, up from the 2021 total weighted cost of \$35.08 per saved Dth. CNBC published on June 17, 2022, “43% of homeowners have delayed big purchases and improvements projects due to inflation.” It goes on to say that financing projects are more expensive with interest rates rising. Forbes published on September 26, 2022, that with inflation rates the highest since 1982, labor and material shortages continued to impact home improvement projects in 2022.

f

TABLE 2 - Appliance Rebates

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH
ThermWise Appliance Rebates
As of December 31, 2022
Docket No. 21-057-25, 22-057-01, & 23-057-05

Line#	Program	PARTICIPATION		COSTS		%	Dth Savings	
		Actual 2022	Estimated 2022	Actual 2022	Budget 2022	Act/Bgt 2022	Actual 2022	C/Dth 2022
1	95% Efficient Furnace	4,404	8500	\$ 1,321,200	\$ 2,550,000	51.8%	41,468	\$ 31.86
2	98% Efficient Furnace	343	1200	\$ 120,050	\$ 420,000	28.6%	3,800	\$ 31.59
3	Gas Water Heater - Tier 2	199	800	\$ 19,900	\$ 80,000	24.9%	455	\$ 43.74
4	Condensing Gas Water Heater	25	60	\$ 8,750	\$ 21,000	41.7%	174	\$ 50.29
5	Hybrid Gas Water Heater	8	40	\$ 2,800	\$ 14,000	20.0%	56	\$ 50.00
6	Boilers Tier 1	2	12	\$ 800	\$ 4,800	16.7%	30	\$ 26.67
7	Boilers Tier 2	130	300	\$ 78,000	\$ 180,000	43.3%	2,621	\$ 29.76
8	Solar Assisted Water Heater (domestic)		4		\$ 3,000	0.0%		\$ -
9	Solar Assisted Water Heater (pool)	5	4	\$ 3,750	\$ 3,000	125.0%	276	\$ 13.59
10	Tankless Gas Water Heater (tier 2)	1,537	2500	\$ 461,100	\$ 750,000	61.5%	11,521	\$ 40.02
11	Direct Vent Gas Fireplace	68	450	\$ 13,600	\$ 90,000	15.1%	588	\$ 23.13
12	Smart Thermostat (appliance)	2,752	4000	\$ 137,600	\$ 200,000	68.8%	18,934	\$ 7.27
13	Boiler Reset Control (appliance)		10		\$ 1,000	0.0%		\$ -
14	Combined Space and Hot Water (appliance)	12	40	\$ 9,000	\$ 30,000	30.0%	182	\$ 49.45
15	Smart Water Heater Controller (appliance)	5	30	\$ 250	\$ 1,500	16.7%	10	\$ 25.00
16	Dual Fuel Heating System	1,320	1000	\$ 1,056,000	\$ 800,000	132.0%	27,456	\$ 38.46
17	Energy Recover Ventilator	4	50	\$ 1,200	\$ 15,000	8.0%	33	\$ 36.36
18	HVAC Monitoring (appliance)	129	5	\$ 6,450	\$ 250	2580.0%	109	\$ 59.17
19	95% Efficient Furnace	184	200	\$ 55,200	\$ 60,000	92.0%	1,295	\$ 42.63
20	98% Efficient Furnace		60		\$ 21,000	0.0%		\$ -
21	Gas Water Heater - Tier 2		4		\$ 400	0.0%		\$ -
22	Solar Assisted Water Heater (pool)		1		\$ 750	0.0%		\$ -
23	Condensing Gas Water Heater	47	0	\$ 16,450	\$ -	0.0%	203	\$ 81.03
24	Boilers Tier 1		1		\$ 400	0.0%		\$ -
25	Boilers Tier 2		1		\$ 600	0.0%		\$ -
26	Direct Vent Gas Fireplace		4		\$ 800	0.0%		\$ -
27	Smart Thermostat (existing multifamily)	26	50	\$ 1,300	\$ 2,500	52.0%	83	\$ 15.66
28	Dua Fuel Heating System		4		\$ 1,800	0.0%		\$ -
29	Energy Recover Ventilator		1		\$ 150	0.0%		\$ -
30	HVAC Monitoring (existing multifamily)		4		\$ 200	0.0%		\$ -
31	Tankless Gas Water Heater (tier 2)	12	4	\$ 3,600	\$ 1,200	300.0%	58	\$ 62.07
32	Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	\$ 601,453	\$ 915,000	65.7%	N/A	\$ -
33	Total	11,212	19,339	3,918,453	\$ 6,168,350.00	63.5%	109,352	\$ 35.83

**Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.*

THERMWISE® BUILDER PROGRAM

The ThermWise® Builder Program is designed to offer specific rebates to builders who use energy-efficient construction techniques. The program is available to residential builders in the Company's Utah service territory. It includes rebates for installing natural gas energy-

efficiency measures in newly constructed single and multifamily residences receiving service on the GS rate schedule.

TABLE 3 - Builder Rebates

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH
Builder Rebates Program
As of December 31, 2022
Docket No. 21-057-25, 22-057-01, & 23-057-05

Line#	Program	Participants		Costs		%	Dth Savings*	
		Actual 2022	Estimated 2022	Actual 2022	Budget 2022	Act/Bgt 2022	Actual 2022	C/Dth 2022
1	Pay for Performance (builder)	4,791	9,000	\$ 4,495,545	\$ 4,050,000	111%	124,455	\$ 36.12
2	Energy Star 3.0 Bonus (builder)	641	800	\$ 32,050	\$ 380,000	8%	1,426	\$ 22.48
3	DOE Zero Energy Ready Bonus (builder)	93	40	\$ 4,650	\$ 25,000	19%	281	\$ 16.55
4	95% Efficient Furnace	2,393	2,500	\$ 717,900	\$ 750,000	96%	19,393	\$ 37.02
5	98% Efficient Furnace with ECM	13	1,000	\$ 4,550	\$ 350,000	1%	126	\$ 36.11
6	.67 EF Storage Water Heater	227	200	\$ 22,700	\$ 20,000	114%	519	\$ 43.74
7	Tankless Water Heater Tier 2	412	400	\$ 123,600	\$ 120,000	103%	3,527	\$ 35.04
8	Condensing Gas Water Heater	16	20	\$ 5,600	\$ 7,000	80%	111	\$ 50.45
9	Hybrid Gas Water Heater		1		\$ 350	0%		\$ -
10	Gas Boiler Rebates Paid - Tier 1	1	10	\$ 400	\$ 4,000	10%	6	\$ 66.67
11	Gas Boiler Rebates Paid - Tier 2	20	30	\$ 12,000	\$ 18,000	67%	258	\$ 46.51
12	Solar Assisted Water Heater - domestic		1		\$ 750	0%	-	\$ -
13	Solar Assisted Water Heater - pool		1		\$ 750	0%		\$ -
14	2X6 R-23 Walls	336	1,000	\$ 50,400	\$ 150,000	34%	1,452	\$ 34.71
15	R-5 Window	70	30	\$ 12,397	\$ 25,000	50%	115	\$ 107.80
16	Smart Thermostat (builder)	525	600	\$ 26,250	\$ 30,000	88%	1,806	\$ 14.53
17	Combined Space and Hot Water (builder)		3		\$ 2,250	0%		\$ -
18	Smart Water Heater Controller (builder)	2	4	\$ 100	\$ 200	50%	4	\$ 25.00
19	Dual Fuel Heating System	225	200	\$ 180,000	\$ 160,000	113%	5,220	\$ 34.48
20	Energy Recovery Ventilator	2	40	\$ 600	\$ 12,000	5%	17	\$ 35.29
21	Exterior Insulation	2	5	\$ 400	\$ 1,000	40%	11	\$ 36.36
22	HVAC Monitoring	2	5	\$ 100	\$ 250	40%	2	\$ 50.00
23	Pay for Performance - MF	3,255	2,500	\$ 1,929,934	\$ 1,125,000	172%	55,756	\$ 34.61
24	Energy Star 3.0 Bonus - MF	625	400	\$ 15,625	\$ 190,000	8%	565	\$ 27.65
25	DOE Zero Energy Ready Bonus - MF		80		\$ 46,000	0%		\$ -
26	95% Efficient Furnace - MF	2,124	3,000	\$ 637,200	\$ 900,000	71%	12,914	\$ 49.34
27	98% Efficient Furnace - MF		300		\$ 105,000	0%		\$ -
28	.67 EF Storage Water Heater - MF	388	2,000	\$ 38,800	\$ 200,000	19%	431	\$ 90.02
29	Tankless Water Heater Tier 2 - MF	836	800	\$ 250,800	\$ 240,000	105%	4,514	\$ 55.56
30	Hybrid Gas Water Heater - MF		4		\$ 1,400	0%		\$ -
31	Boilers Tier 1 - MF		4		\$ 1,600	0%		\$ -
32	Boilers Tier 2 - MF		12		\$ 7,200	0%		\$ -
33	Solar Assisted Water Heater - domestic MF		4		\$ 3,000	0%		\$ -
34	Solar Assisted Water Heater - pool MF		4		\$ 3,000	0%		\$ -
35	R-5 Window		4		\$ 10	0%		\$ -
36	Smart Thermostat (new multifamily)	141	800	\$ 7,050	\$ 40,000	18%	192	\$ 36.72
37	Combined Space and Hot Water (new multifamily)		15		\$ 11,250	0%		\$ -
38	Dual Fuel Heating System (multi Family)		4		\$ 1,800	0%		\$ -
39	Energy Recovery Ventilator (new Multifamily)		4		\$ 600			\$ -
40	Exterior insulation (new multifamily)		1		\$ 150			
41	HVAC Monitoring (new multifamily)		10		\$ 500			
42	Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	\$ 415,047	\$ 520,000	80%	N/A	N/A
43	Total	17,140	25,836	8,983,698	9,503,060	94.5%	233,101	\$ 38.54

*Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

As shown in Table 3, the Builder Program rebated 90% or \$8.6 million (less administrative

overhead of \$415,047) of the 2022 budget of \$9.5 million. The 2022 rebates were considerably higher than the 2021 rebates of \$4.2 million. Single-family Pay for Performance incentive maintains the most significant participation rate with 4,791 participants and \$4.5 million rebated. The Pay for Performance with MF (multi-family) came in second with 3,255 actual participants and redeemed rebates of \$1.9 million. On December 20, 2022, DEU notified the Commission that the 2022 Builder Rebate Program spending was 86.9% of the budget in November 2022¹. As noted above, the established budget was not exceeded. The Builder Program had a lower weighted cost per Dth of \$38.54 than the 2021 level of \$41.33 per Dth.

THERMWISE® BUSINESS PROGRAM

In the ThermWise® Business Program, 65 prescriptive measures are available to commercial entities to improve energy efficiency. The Business Program spent 64.38% of its annual budget for the year. The 2022 average cost per deemed Dth was lowered to \$25.92 compared to the 2021 average of \$35.77 per Dth.

TABLE 4 - Business Rebates

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH
Business Rebates Program
As of December 31, 2022
Docket No. 21-057-25, 22-057-01, & 23-057-05

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2022	Budget 2022	Actual 2022	Budget 2022	% of 2022	Actual 2022	C/Dth 2022
1	Business Custom	28	40	\$ 344,040	\$ 560,000	61.4%	36,847	\$ 9.34
2	95% Efficient Furnace	113	500	\$ 33,900	\$ 150,000	22.6%	1,591	\$ 21.31
3	98% Efficient Furnace		50		\$ 17,500	0.0%		\$ -
4	Gas Storage Water Heater - Tier 2 <75kBtu .67	2	10	\$ 200	\$ 1,000	20.0%	5	\$ 40.00
5	Gas Storage Water Heater >75kBtu	31	100	\$ 15,032	\$ 60,000	25.1%	1,744	\$ 8.62
6	High Efficiency Gas Water Heater - Tankless <200kBTU	29	25	\$ 11,477	\$ 10,000	114.8%	803	\$ 14.29
7	High Efficiency Gas Water Heater - Tankless >200kBTU	7	25	\$ 15,100	\$ 25,500	59.2%	1,057	\$ 14.29
8	High Efficiency Gas Water Heater - Tankless >200kBTU	16	20	\$ 31,176	\$ 30,600	101.9%	2,598	\$ 12.00
9	Condensing Gas Water Heater		4		\$ 1,400	0.0%		\$ -
10	Hybrid Gas Water Heater	1	5	\$ 350	\$ 1,750	20.0%	8	\$ 43.75
11	Combined Space / Water Heater (business)	-	1		\$ 450	0.0%		\$ -
12	Commercial Clothes Washer	23	5	\$ 1,725	\$ 375	460.0%	120	\$ 14.38
13	Boiler Reset Control	4	5	\$ 1,000	\$ 1,250	80.0%	237	\$ 4.22
14	Boiler Tune-up Tier 1		25		\$ 2,500	0.0%		\$ -
15	Boiler Tune-up Tier 2		10		\$ 2,000	0.0%		\$ -
16	Boiler Tune-up Tier 3		25		\$ 7,500	0.0%		\$ -
17	Low Flow Pre-rinse Spray Valve		25		\$ 800	0.0%		\$ -
18	Smart Thermostat (business)	39	350	\$ 3,707	\$ 24,500	15.1%	297	\$ 12.48
19	Direct Contact Water Heater	1	1	\$ 10,890	\$ 298	3654.4%	1,814	\$ 6.00

¹ Dominion Energy Utah's Report on Energy Efficiency Expenditures and Dekatherm Savings to Date, Docket No. 21-057-25, December 21, 2022.

As of December 31, 2022
Docket No. 21-057-25, 22-057-01, & 23-057-05
Table 4 (continued)

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2022	Budget 2022	Actual 2022	Budget 2022	% of Budget	Actual 2022	C/Dth 2022
20	Direct Fired Heater	1	20	\$ 1,102	\$ 24,000	4.6%	122	\$ 9.03
21	Boiler Hot Water < 300,000 Btu/h (business)	2	10	\$ 968	\$ 40,000	2.4%	50	\$ 19.36
22	Boiler Hot Water ≥ 300,000 < 2,500,000 (business)	14	50	\$ 82,869	\$ 203,125	40.8%	3,264	\$ 25.39
23	Boiler Hot Water ≥ 300,000 < 2,500,000 95% + (business)	42	50	\$ 158,449	\$ 218,750	72.4%	8,837	\$ 17.93
24	Boiler Hot Water ≥ 2,500,000 Btu/h (business)		10		\$ 97,500	0.0%		\$ -
25	Boiler Hot Water ≥ 2,500,000 Btu/h 95% + (business)	14	10	\$ 167,990	\$ 105,000	160.0%	7,910	\$ 21.24
26	Boiler Steam <300,000 Btu/h (business)	2	1	\$ 1,000	\$ 4,140	24.2%	72	\$ 13.89
27	Boiler Steam (Except Natural Draft) ≥ 300,000 Btu/h (business)		5		\$ 54,030	0.0%		\$ -
28	Boiler Steam (Natural Draft) ≥ 300,000 Btu/h (business)		10		\$ 108,060	0.0%		\$ -
29	Boiler O2 Trim Controls	13	15	\$ 4,600	\$ 3,750	122.7%	258	\$ 17.83
30	Boiler Linkglass Controls	4	5	\$ 5,000	\$ 3,125	160.0%	344	\$ 14.53
31	Gas Unit Heater NonCondensing	93	50	\$ 36,550	\$ 12,500	292.4%	1,291	\$ 28.31
32	Gas Unit Heater Condensing		5		8,100	0.0%		\$ -
33	Green Certified New Buildings	1	10	15,000	50,000	30.0%	1,680	\$ 8.93
34	Infrared Heating System	13	50	14,300	37,500	38.1%	1,101	\$ 12.99
35	Modulating Infrared Heaters (NC or Replacing Non-IR) (business)		10		10,875	0.0%		\$ -
36	Modulating Infrared Heaters (Replacing Non-IR) (business)		1		290	0.0%		\$ -
37	Condensing RTU's (business)		1		1,875	0.0%		\$ -
38	High Efficiency Gas Combo Oven	7	35	7,000	35,000	20.0%	226	\$ 30.97
39	High Efficiency Gas Combo Oven (Used)		1		500	0.0%		\$ -
40	Energy Star Gas Commercial Fryer	84	30	42,000	22,500	186.7%	2,715	\$ 15.47
41	Energy Star Gas Commercial Fryer (Used)		1		375	0.0%		\$ -
42	High Efficiency Gas Convection Oven	29	50	14,500	37,500	38.7%	817	\$ 17.75
43	High Efficiency Gas Convection Oven (Used)		1		375	0.0%		\$ -
44	High Efficiency Gas Griddle	1	5	300	1,500	20.0%	12	\$ 25.00
45	High Efficiency Gas Griddle (Used)		1		150	0.0%		\$ -
46	Energy Star Gas Steam Cooker	5	10	5,000	10,000	50.0%	363	\$ 13.77
47	Energy Star Gas Steam Cooker (Used)		1		500	0.0%		\$ -
48	Attic Insulation (retrofit)	-	25		28,000	0.0%		\$ -
49	Wall Insulation (retrofit)	1	10	482	12,000	4.0%	12	\$ 40.17
50	Demand Control Ventilation Systems	5	10	15,050	10,000	150.5%	1,637	\$ 9.19
51	Demand Control Ventilation Systems (DCV) Packaged (r	14	100	38,400	40,000	96.0%	2,089	\$ 18.38
52	Pipe Insulation (Hot Water)		10		750	0.0%		\$ -
53	Pipe Insulation (Steam)		5		1,000	0.0%		\$ -
54	High Efficiency Charbroiler		5		5,000	0.0%		\$ -
55	High Efficiency Charbroiler (Used)		1		500	0.0%		\$ -
56	Conveyor Oven		5		5,000	0.0%		\$ -
57	Conveyor Oven (Used)		1		500	0.0%		\$ -
58	Gas Dryer Moisture Sensor		1		25	0.0%		\$ -
59	Modulating Gas Dryer	14	5	1,050	375	280.0%	358	\$ 2.93
60	Solar Assisted Water Heater- Pool- Business		1		750	0.0%		\$ -
61	Dual Fuel Heating System (business)	2	10	1,600	8,000	20.0%	42	\$ 38.46
62	Advanced rooftop controls > 5 tons and < 10 tons	82	30	41,000	15,000	273.3%	2,230	\$ 18.38
63	Advanced rooftop controls > 10 tons and < 15 tons	53	30	34,450	19,500	176.7%	1,781	\$ 19.35
64	Advanced rooftop controls > 15 tons	3	10	5,600	8,000	70.0%	182	\$ 30.70
65	Prescriptive ERV	3	25	\$ 16,743	\$ 2,500	669.7%	22	\$ 761.05
66	Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	1,011,265	1,234,000	82.0%		\$ -
67	Total	796	1,958	2,190,865	3,379,343	64.8%	84,536	\$ 25.92

*Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

THERMWISE® HOME ENERGY PLAN PROGRAM

The ThermWise® Home Energy Plan Program allows customers to evaluate their current energy efficiency efforts, with suggestions on improving their efficiency. The home energy plans can either be an on-site audit conducted by a qualified DEU technician or a mail-in audit in which the participants answer questions and receive advice from DEU. This program continues to have benefits in addition to those seen in the data below. It introduces customers to the potential savings they may realize by implementing additional energy efficiency measures. Table 5 shows Dth savings in 2022 of 29,086, up from 26,458 in 2021, a considerable increase.

TABLE 5 - Home Energy Plans

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH
Home Energy Plans Program
As of December 31, 2022
Docket No. 21-057-25, 22-057-01, & 23-057-05

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2022	Budget 2022	Actual 2022	Budget 2022	% of 2022	Dth 2022	C/Dth 2022
1	Efficiency Measures	1,999	2,240	\$ 35,299	\$ 38,467	91.8%	29,086	\$ 1.21
2	Administrative & Over	N/A	N/A	290,427	470,000	61.8%	N/A	0
3	Total	1,999	2,240	\$ 325,726	\$ 508,467	64.1%	29,086	\$ 11.20

*Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.

**Participants, Plans Completed and Efficiency Items are based on reported numbers from the ThermWise Home Energy Experts.

THERMWISE® WEATHERIZATION PROGRAM

Table 6 summarizes the results of the ThermWise® Weatherization Program. Weatherization projects were the second-highest rebated measures of the ThermWise® Energy Efficiency Programs, with stabilized participation at 2021 levels. The Weatherization Program reached 88.3% of budgeted expenditures, lower than the 2021 Weatherization Program, which reached 96.5% of budgeted costs. The primary drivers of the program were Air Sealing at \$4.5 million and Attic Insulation at \$1.4 million.

TABLE 6 - Weatherization Rebates

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH
Weatherization Rebates Program
As of December 31, 2022
Docket No. 21-057-25, 22-057-01, & 23-057-05

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2022	Budget 2022	Actual 2022	Budget 2022	% of Budget	Actual 2022	C/Dth 2022
1	Attic Insulation Tier 1 - .25 per sq. ft	6,468	11,700	\$ 1,347,725	\$ 2,296,125	58.7%	22,409	\$ 60.14
2	Attic Insulation Tier 2	2,595	6,500	\$ 183,858	\$ 214,305	85.8%	2,663	\$ 69.04
3	Floor Insulation	51	185	\$ 10,235	\$ 14,356	71.3%	278	\$ 36.82
4	Wall Insulation	199	780	\$ 56,735	\$ 119,340	47.5%	802	\$ 70.74
5	R-5 Windows	2,466	900	\$ 292,403	\$ 337,500	86.6%	6,531	\$ 44.77
6	Duct Sealing & Insulation	86	200	\$ 35,744	\$ 60,480	59.1%	1,181	\$ 30.27
7	Air Sealing	9,048	12,000	\$ 4,522,149	\$ 4,195,200	107.8%	52,076	\$ 86.84
8	Pipe Insulation (weatherization)		5		\$ 13	0.0%		\$ -
9	Exterior insulation (weatherization)	12	5	\$ 5,733	\$ 2,400	238.9%	57	\$ 100.58
10	Attic Insulation Tier 1 (multifamily) - .25 per sq. ft	136	40	\$ 28,765	\$ 4,600	625.3%	488	\$ 58.94
11	Attic Insulation (multifamily) Tier 2	22	40	\$ 1,001	\$ 2,212	45.3%	15	\$ 66.73
12	Floor Insulation (multifamily)		5		\$ 364	0.0%		\$ -
13	Wall Insulation (multifamily)		10		\$ 1,920	0.0%		\$ -
14	R-5 Windows (multifamily)	27	5	\$ 1,060	\$ 2,500	42.4%	24	\$ 44.17
15	Exerior insulation (multifamily)		5		\$ 2,400	0.0%		\$ -
16	Duct Sealing & Insulation (multifamily)		5		\$ 1,560	0.0%		\$ -
17	Administrative & Overheads	N/A	N/A	\$ 614,688	\$ 785,000	78.3%	N/A	\$ -
18	Total	21,110	32,385	7,100,096	8,040,274	88.3%	86,523	\$ 82.06
*Savings reflects the net Dth deemed savings based on actual participants with an 80% net-to-gross ratio applied.								

The 2022 total weighted cost for these measures is \$82.06 per saved Dth, which increased from \$68.25 total weighted price per Dth in 2021. Monitoring and discussion with the Advisory Committee should continue around the best methods and practice incentives for the low-income population.

THERMWISE® MARKET TRANSFORMATION PROGRAM

Table 7 shows that the ThermWise® MTI program costs were 91.6% of the expected 2022 levels. Expenditures increased from 980,669 in 2021 to \$1.2 million. More community events opened during the year, and the Company could participate in as many projects as planned.

TABLE 7 - Market Initiative

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH
Market Transformation
As of December 31, 2022
Docket No. 21-057-25, 22-057-01, & 23-057-05

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2022	Budget 2022	Actual 2022	Budget 2022	% of Budget	Actual 2022	Average Weight
1	Market Transformation Total	N/A	N/A	\$ 1,208,504	\$ 1,320,000	91.6%	N/A	N/A

THERMWISE® ENERGY COMPARISON REPORT

Table 8 shows the ThermWise® Energy Comparison Report cost of \$477,746, representing 87.8% of the expected \$544,000 for the 2022 budget. The 2022 costs were slightly less than the 2021 amount of \$493,875.

TABLE 8 - Energy Reports

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH
Energy Comparison
As of December 31, 2022
Docket No. 21-057-25, 22-057-01, & 23-057-05

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2022	Budget 2022	Actual 2022	Budget 2022	% of Budget	Actual 2022	C/Dth 2022
1	Energy Comparison Report Total	228,000	228,000	\$ 477,746	\$ 544,000	87.8%	291,840	\$ 1.64

The current distribution of the energy comparison reports is to approximately 228,000 participants, up slightly from 226,000 customers in 2021. The information is available to customers via opt-in and opt-out programs. In reviewing 2022 deemed Dth savings of 291,840, the total weighted cost of \$1.64 per saved Dth is down from \$1.73 in 2021.

THERMWISE® LOW-INCOME EFFICIENCY PROGRAM

Table 9 illustrates the designed incentives and measures for low-income participants. The ThermWise® Low-Income Efficiency Program was budgeted at \$749,519. The program includes \$500,000 to provide low-income qualified residences with energy-efficient furnaces. The Low-Income Efficiency Tariff paragraph allows approved non-profit or governmental

agencies to apply for rebates under the ThermWise® Programs. This enables eligible agencies to be refunded to complete additional final weatherization measures for their work. The Utah Department of Workforce Services' Housing and Community Development Division (HCD) qualifies under this provision. HCD reports its activity quarterly and includes the saved Dths due to its efforts as part of the report filed by the Company on the Energy Efficiency Program results.

Table 9 shows the results of the ThermWise® Low Income Efficiency Program. The table points out that 92.0% of the total budget was spent. The 2022 total weighted cost for the measures implemented was \$73.96 per saved Dth. The program increased in cost from the 2021 total weighted cost of \$69.01 per saved Dth for the measures implemented.

TABLE 9 - Low Income

DOMINION ENERGY UTAH
Low Income Efficiency
As of December 31, 2022
Docket No. 21-057-25, 22-057-01, & 23-057-05

Line #	Program	Participants		Costs			Dth Savings	
		Actual 2022	Budget 2022	Actual 2022	Budget 2022	% of Budget	Actual 2022	C/Dth 2022
1	95% Efficient Furnace	86	150	25,800	\$ 45,000	57.3%	1,012	\$ 25.49
2	98% Efficient Furnace	1	4	350	\$ 1,400	25.0%	14	\$ 25.00
3	Gas Water Heater - Tier 2	7	38	700	\$ 3,800	18.4%	28	\$ 25.00
4	Boilers Tier 1	1	-	400	\$ -		19	\$ 21.05
5	Boilers Tier 2	1	-	600	\$ -	0.0%	25	\$ 24.00
6	Condensing Water Heater	5	-	1,750	\$ -	0.0%	43	\$ 40.70
7	Attic Insulation - Tier 1	225	200	28,774	\$ 61,600	46.7%	610	\$ 47.17
8	Attic Insulation Tier 2	94	90	1,050	\$ 6,930	15.2%	20	\$ 52.50
9	Floor Insulation	28	20	1,902	\$ 4,260	44.6%	65	\$ 29.26
10	Wall Insulation	101	80	10,120	\$ 23,604	42.9%	179	\$ 56.54
11	Duct Sealing & Insulation	1	20	336	\$ 8,385	4.0%	13	\$ 25.85
12	Air Sealing	254	200	78,270	\$ 60,040	130.4%	1,158	\$ 67.59
13	Smart Thermostat (low income)	118	210	5,900	\$ 10,500	56.2%	1,015	\$ 5.81
14	Low Income Furnace Replacement	250	600	\$ 519,375	\$ 500,000	103.9%	5,125	\$ 101.34
15	Administrative & Overheads	N.A	N/A	14,365	\$ 24,000	59.9%	N/A	\$ -
16	Total	1,172	1,612	\$ 689,693	\$ 749,519	92.0%	9,325	\$ 73.96

Forecasted Benefit/Cost Test Results and Actuals for 2022

The Company provided DEU Exhibit 1 Confidential charts presenting the ratios for the following efficiency measures:

- 1) Total Resources Cost
- 2) Participant Test
- 3) Utility Cost Test, and
- 4) Ratepayer Impact Measure Test.

All ratios are greater than the value of 1 based on the forecasted and actual results on the information provided, except the Ratepayer Impact Measurer Test, which is less than 1. A value greater than 1 indicates the efficiency of the program.

Conclusion

The Division has reviewed the information provided and concluded that the Company complies with its reporting requirements. The Division acknowledges the overall success of the Energy Efficiency Programs initiated by Dominion Energy as they benefit all ratepayers by reducing natural gas usage levels. The Company and other interested parties should continue evaluating the specific program mix to ensure the most significant value is achieved. The Division recommends that the Commission acknowledge the EE Program report for the year ending December 31, 2022. Dominion and the Advisory Group may wish to address trends in various programs and their implications for future budgeting and schedules.

cc: Michael Orton, Dominion Energy Utah
Michele Beck, Office of Consumer Services