

R746 Public Service Commission Administration

R746-100 Practice and Procedures Governing Formal Hearings

Rule 746-100-16. Use of information claimed to be confidential in Commission proceedings.

A. Information, documents and material submitted or requested in or relating to any Commission proceeding which is claimed to be confidential will be treated in as follows.

1. a. Nature of Confidential Information. A person (Providing Party) required or requested to provide documents, data, information, studies, and other materials of a sensitive, proprietary or confidential nature (Confidential Information) to the Commission or to any party in connection with a Commission proceeding may request protection of such information in accordance with the terms of this rule. Confidential treatment shall be requested only to the extent a good faith reasonable basis exists for claiming that specific information constitutes a trade secret or is otherwise of such a highly-sensitive or proprietary nature that public disclosure would be inappropriate. Confidential treatment shall be requested narrowly as to only that specific information for which protection is reasonably required.

b. Identification of Confidential Information. All documents, data, information, studies and other materials filed in conjunction with a Commission proceeding, made available to proceeding participants, furnished, or whether made available pursuant to any interrogatories, or requests for information, subpoenas, depositions, or other modes of discovery or otherwise, that are claimed to be Confidential Information, shall be furnished pursuant to the terms of this rule or any superseding Protective Order, and shall be treated by all persons accorded access thereto pursuant to this rule or Protective Order, and shall neither be used nor disclosed by any recipient thereof except for the purpose of the proceeding in which it was obtained and solely in accordance with this rule or superseding Protective Order. All material claimed to be Confidential Information shall be so marked by the person producing it by stamping or noting the same with the a designation substantially as follows “CONFIDENTIAL - - SUBJECT TO UTAH PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION RULE 746-100-16”, or “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” or “CONFIDENTIAL - - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER IN DOCKET NO. XX-XXX-XX (reflecting the appropriate docket number” All copies of documents so marked will be made on yellow paper. Parties shall ensure that line numbering in any redacted version of a document shall conform to and retain the general formatting and line numbering used in the unredacted version of the document. Individuals providing electronic documents to the Commission should file both a confidential and non-confidential version each clearly marked as such. For purposes hereof, notes made pertaining to or as the result of a review of Confidential Information shall be considered Confidential Information and subject to the terms of this rule.

c. Use of Confidential Information and Persons Entitled to Review. The Commission, Division of Public Utilities, and Office of Consumer Services shall be provided with Confidential Information and may use the Confidential Information as these agencies deem necessary to perform their statutory functions, provided they shall protect the confidentiality of the information as required by Utah law. Other than these state agencies, all Confidential Information made available pursuant to this rule shall be given solely to counsel for the participants (which may include counsels’ paralegals, administrative assistants and clerical staff to the extent reasonably necessary for performance of work on the matter), and shall not be used

nor disclosed except for the purpose of the proceeding in which they are provided and in accordance with this rule; provided, however, that access to any specific Confidential Information may be authorized by counsel, solely for the purpose of the proceeding, to those persons indicated by the participants as being their experts in the matter (including such experts' administrative assistants and clerical staff, and persons employed by the participants, to the extent reasonably necessary for performance of work on the matter). Persons designated as experts shall not include persons employed by the participants who could use the information in their normal job functions to the competitive disadvantage of the person providing the Confidential Information. The Commission, the Division of Public Utilities, and the Office of Consumer Services, and their respective counsel and staff, under and pursuant to the applicable provisions of Title 54, Utah Code Ann., the Rules of Civil Procedure and the Rules of the Commission, may have access to any Confidential Information made available pursuant to this rule or Protective Order and shall be bound by the terms of this rule, except as otherwise stated herein and except for the requirement of signing a nondisclosure agreement. Further, nothing herein shall prevent disclosure as required by law pursuant to interrogatories, administrative requests for information or documents, subpoena, civil investigative demand or similar process, provided, however, that the person being required to disclose Confidential Information shall promptly give prior notice by telephone and written notice of such requirement of disclosure by electronic mail facsimile and overnight mail to the person that provided such Confidential Information, addressed to the providing person and attorneys of record for such person, so that the person that provided the Confidential Information may seek appropriate restrictions on disclosure or an appropriate protective order. The disclosing person will not oppose action by, and will cooperate with the person that provided the Confidential Information to obtain an appropriate protective order or other reliable assurance that confidential treatment will be accorded the Confidential Information.

d. Nondisclosure Agreement. Prior to giving obtaining access to Confidential Information, as contemplated in 1.b. above, counsel or any experts shall agree in writing to comply with and be bound by this rule and any Protective Order. Confidential Information shall not be disclosed to any person who has not signed a Nondisclosure Agreement in the form which is provided below or referenced in the Protective Order. The Nondisclosure Agreement shall require the person to whom disclosure is to be made to read a copy of this rule and any applicable Protective Order and to certify in writing that he or she has reviewed the same and has consented to be bound by the terms. The agreement shall contain the signatory's full name, permanent address and employer, and the name of the person with whom the signatory is associated. Such agreement shall be delivered to the providing person and counsel for the providing person prior to the expert gaining access to the Confidential Information.

The Nondisclosure Agreement may be in the following form:

"Nondisclosure Agreement. I have reviewed Public Service Commission of Utah Rule 746-100-16 and/or the Protective Order entered by the Public Service Commission of Utah in Docket No. XX-XXX-XX with respect to the review and use of confidential information and agree to comply with the terms and conditions of the rule and/or Protective Order." Thereafter there shall be lines upon which shall be placed the individual's signature, the typed or printed name of the individual, identification or name of the individual's employer or firm employing the individual (if any), the business address for the individual, identification or name of the party in the proceeding with which the individual is associated, and the date the nondisclosure agreement is

executed by the individual.

e. Additional protective measures. To the extent a Providing Party reasonably claims that additional protective measures, beyond those required under this rule, are warranted for certain highly proprietary, highly sensitive or highly confidential material (Highly Sensitive Information), the Providing Party shall promptly inform the requester (Requesting Party) of the claimed highly sensitive nature of identified material and the additional protective measures requested by the Requested Party. If the Providing Party and Requesting Party are unable to promptly reach agreement on the treatment of Highly Sensitive Information, the Providing Party shall petition the Commission for an order granting additional protective measures. The Providing Party shall set forth the particular basis for: the claim, the need for the specific, additional protective measures, and the reasonableness of the requested, additional protection. A Requesting Party and any other party may respond to the petition and oppose or propose alternative protective measures to those requested by the Providing Party. Disputes between the parties shall be resolved by the Commission.

2. a. Challenge to Confidentiality or Proposed Additional Protective Measures. This rule establishes a procedure for the expeditious handling of Confidential Information; it shall not be construed as an agreement, or ruling on the confidentiality of any document.

b. In the event that persons are unable to agree that certain documents, data, information, studies, or other matters constitute Confidential Information, are highly sensitive documents and information referred to in A.1.e. above, or agree on the appropriate treatment of Highly Sensitive Information, the person objecting to the classification as Confidential Information or the person claiming highly sensitive documents and information and the need for additional protective measures shall forthwith submit the disputes to the Commission for resolution.

c. Any person at any time upon at least ten (10) days prior notice, when practicable, may seek by appropriate pleading, to have documents that have been designated as Confidential Information, or which were accepted into the sealed record in accordance with this rule or a Protective Order, removed from the protective requirements of this rule or the Protective Order, or from the sealed record and placed in the public record. If the confidential, or proprietary nature of this information is challenged, resolution of the issue shall be made by the Commission after proceedings *in camera* which shall be conducted under circumstances such that only those persons duly authorized to have access to such confidential matter shall be present. The record of such *in camera* hearings shall be marked substantially as follows "CONFIDENTIAL--SUBJECT TO RULE 746-100-16 OR PROTECTIVE ORDER IN CASE NO. XX-XXX-XX (reflecting the appropriate docket number)." unless the Commission determines, and so provides by order, that such marking need not occur. It shall be transcribed only upon agreement by the parties, or order of the Commission, and in that event shall be separately bound, segregated, sealed, and withheld from inspection by any person not bound by the terms of this rule or Protective Order, unless and until released from the restrictions of this rule or Protective Order, either through agreement of the parties, or after notice to the parties and hearing, pursuant to an order of the Commission. In the event the Commission should rule in response to such a pleading that any information should be removed from the protective requirements of this rule or Protective Order, or from the protection of the sealed record, such order of the Commission shall not be effective for a period of ten (10) days after entry of the order.

3. a. Receipt into Evidence. At least ten (10) days prior to the use of or substantive

reference to any Confidential Information as evidence, if practicable, the person intending to use such Confidential Information shall make that intention known to the providing person. The requesting person and the providing person shall make a good faith effort to reach an agreement so that the Confidential Information can be used in a manner which will not reveal its trade secret, confidential or proprietary nature. If such efforts fail, the providing person shall separately identify, within five (5) business days, which portions, if any, of the documents to be offered or referenced on the record containing Confidential Information shall be placed in the sealed record. Only one (1) copy of documents designated by the providing person to be placed in a sealed record shall be made and only for that purpose. Otherwise, persons shall make only general references to Confidential Information in any proceedings.

b. Seal. While in the custody of the Commission, Confidential Information provided pursuant to this rule or a Protective Order shall be marked substantially as follows: "CONFIDENTIAL--SUBJECT TO PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF UTAH RULE 746-100-16 OR PROTECTIVE ORDER IN CASE NO. XX-XXX-XX (reflecting the appropriate docket)".

c. In Camera Hearing. Any Confidential Information that must be orally disclosed to be placed in a sealed record of a proceeding shall be offered in an *in camera* hearing, attended only by persons authorized to have access to the Confidential Information under this rule or Protective Order. Similarly, cross-examination on or substantive reference to Confidential Information, as well as that portion of the record containing references thereto, shall be similarly marked and treated.

d. Appeal. Sealed portions of the record in any proceeding may be forwarded to any court of competent jurisdiction on appeal in accordance with applicable rules and regulations, but under seal as designated herein, for the information and use of the court.

e. Return. Unless otherwise ordered, Confidential Information, including transcripts of any depositions to which a claim of confidentiality is made, shall remain under seal, shall continue to be subject to the protective requirements of this rule or Protective Order, and shall be returned to the providing person or counsel for the providing person within 30 days after final settlement, or conclusion of the matters in which they were used, including administrative or judicial review thereof. Alternatively, a person receiving Confidential Information pursuant to the terms of this rule or Protective Order may certify, within 30 days after final settlement, or conclusion of the matter including administrative or judicial review thereof, that the Confidential Information has been destroyed. Counsel who are provided access to Confidential Information pursuant to the terms of this rule or Protective Order may retain the Confidential Information, their notes, work papers or other documents as their attorneys' work product created with respect to their use and access to Confidential Information in the matter. An expert witness, accorded access to Confidential Information pursuant to this rule or Protective Order, shall provide to counsel for the person on whose behalf the expert was retained or employed, the expert's notes, work papers or other documents pertaining or relating to any Confidential Information. Counsel shall retain these experts' documents with counsel's documents. In order to facilitate their ongoing responsibility, this provision shall not apply to the Commission, the Division of Public Utilities or the Office of Consumer Services, which may retain Confidential Information obtained under this rule or Protective Order subject to the other terms of this rule or Protective Order. Any party that intends to use or disclose Confidential Information obtained pursuant to this rule or a Protective Order in any subsequent Commission dockets or proceedings, shall do so in

accordance with the terms of this rule or any applicable protective orders issued in such other subsequent Commission dockets or proceedings and only after providing notice of such intent to the providing person along with an identification of the original source of the Confidential Information..

4. Use in Proceedings. Where reference to Confidential Information is required in pleadings, cross-examinations, briefs, arguments, or motions, it shall be by citation of title, or exhibit number, or by some other nonconfidential description. Any further use of, or substantive references to Confidential Information shall be placed in a separate section of the pleading, brief, or document and submitted under seal. This sealed section shall be served only on counsel of record (one copy each), who have signed a Nondisclosure Agreement and counsel for the Division of Public Utilities and Office of Consumer Services. All the protections afforded in this rule apply to materials prepared and distributed under this paragraph.

5. Use in Decisions and Orders. The Commission will attempt to refer to Confidential Information in only a general, or conclusionary form and will avoid reproduction in any decision of Confidential Information to the greatest possible extent. If it is necessary for a determination in a proceeding to discuss Confidential Information other than in a general, or conclusionary form, it shall be placed in a separate section of an Order, or Decision, under seal. This sealed section shall be served only on counsel of record (one copy each) who have signed a Nondisclosure Agreement and counsel for the Division of Public Utilities and Office of Consumer Services. Counsel for other parties shall receive the cover sheet to the sealed portion and may review the sealed portion on file with the Commission once they have signed a Nondisclosure Agreement.

6. Segregation of Files. Those parts of any writing, depositions reduced to writing, written examination, interrogatories and answers thereto, or other written references to Confidential Information in the course of discovery, if filed with the Commission, will be sealed by the Commission, segregated in the files of the Commission, and withheld from inspection by any person not bound by the terms of this rule or Protective Order, unless such Confidential Information is released from the restrictions of this rule or Protective Order, either through agreement of the parties, or after notice to the parties and hearing, pursuant to an order of the Commission and/or final order of a court having jurisdiction.

7. Preservation of Confidentiality. All persons who may be entitled to receive, or who are afforded access to any Confidential Information by reason of this rule or Protective Order shall neither use, nor disclose the Confidential Information for purposes of business or competition, or any other purpose other than the purposes of preparation for and conduct of Commission proceedings, and then solely as contemplated herein, and shall take reasonable precautions to keep the Confidential Information secure in accordance with the purposes and intent of this rule or a Protective Order.

8. Reservation of Rights. Persons affected by the terms of this rule or a Protective Order retain the right to question, challenge, and object to the admissibility of any and all data, information, studies and other matters furnished under the terms of this rule or a Protective Order in response to interrogatories, requests for information, other modes of discovery, or cross-examination on the grounds of relevancy or materiality. This rule or a Protective Order shall in no way constitute any waiver of the rights of any person to contest any assertion by another person or finding by the Commission that any information is a trade secret, confidential, or privileged, and to appeal any assertion or finding.

Key: utility, confidential information, protective order
54-1-1, 54-3-21, 54-1-3, 54-4-2, 54-4-1.5